

**Summary of USDA Permit Citations  
for  
Circuses with Elephants Performing in Tennessee  
2000 to 2003**

**(revised 3/17/03)**

**Carson & Barnes Circus**

**Circus Pages**

**Clyde Brothers Johnson Circus**

**Franzen Bros. Circus**

**George Carden Circus**

**Georgina Dohohoe**

**Hanneford Family Circus**

**Hawthorn Corporation**

**Kelly Miller Circus**

**Ringling Bros. And Barnum & Bailey Circus**

**Royal Hanneford Circus**

**Sterling & Reid Bros. Circus**

**Walker Bros. Circus**

**William Morris**

**Carson & Barnes Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Carson & Barnes Circus numerous times for failure to provide veterinary care and minimum space, for failure to provide shelter from the elements, for failure to maintain transport trailers, for inadequate ventilation, for unsound fencing that failed to protect spectators and the animals, for rusty animal cages, for giving animals unclean water, and for failure to keep animal care records. The Carson & Barnes Circus animal care director was videotaped viciously attacking elephants with a bull hook, shocking elephants with an electric prod, and instructing trainers to embed sharp, metal hooks into the elephants' flesh until the elephants scream in pain. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**August 9, 2002:** A Carson & Barnes truck carrying the circus's two African elephants, Paula and Kristi, crashed in Rhinebeck, N.Y. The driver veered onto the right shoulder, which had a 4-foot drop-off, and the truck tipped onto its side. The road was closed for five hours while emergency workers used power tools to cut into the trailer, free the trapped elephants, and remove the wreckage. The elephants suffered minor injuries. The driver was charged with having an uninspected trailer and an insufficient logbook, as well as failure to keep right.

**June 5, 2002:** The USDA again cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to an African elephant named Paula with skin problems.

**May 14, 2002:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to an African elephant named Paula with skin problems.

**May 2, 2002:** According to the *Tulsa World*, the USDA has an open investigation against Carson & Barnes as a result of a PETA undercover videotape that showed elephants being abused during training sessions (see January 9, 2002). Tim Frisco, the trainer depicted in the video, still works for the circus.

**January 10, 2002:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to have adequate perimeter fencing. The inspector also noted that Paula, an African elephant, still had very rough skin that was not improving.

**January 9, 2002:** PETA supplied videotape to federal authorities of Carson & Barnes' animal care director, Tim Frisco, viciously attacking, yelling at, cursing, and shocking endangered Asian elephants. The elephants emit agonizing screams while recoiling from the assaults. Frisco instructs other elephant trainers to hurt the elephants until they scream, holler, and run away, to forcefully strike the elephants with a bull hook, and to sink a sharp metal bull hook into their flesh and twist it back and forth until they begin to scream in pain. The videotape also shows a handler using a blowtorch on an elephant's skin to remove hair and chained elephants and caged bears exhibiting extreme degrees of stereotypic behavior caused by mental distress.

**May 22, 2001:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide veterinary care to a zebu with overgrown hooves, failure to have 15 elephants under the direct control and supervision of a knowledgeable handler while children, parents, and teachers were present, overworking a camel used for rides, allowing a dog to run loose in the parking lot, failure to provide shelter to a pygmy hippopotamus, a zebu, a water buffalo, llamas, goats, and camels during gusty and rainy weather

conditions, failure to provide minimum space to elephants stored in transport trailers and other elephants chained by two legs, failure to provide minimum space to big cats stored in travel cages, and improper food storage.

**March 14, 2001:** According to a Carson & Barnes animal inventory, its baby elephant Jennie was on the road performing with the circus without her mother, Isa. The May/June 2000 edition of *The White Tops* reported that Jennie was first put on the road at 16 months of age. Elephant expert and veterinarian SJR Adams, MRCVS, states that baby elephants should be kept with their mothers for at least eight to ten years. Prematurely removing young calves from their mothers causes depression, weakens the immune system, and can lead to life-threatening infectious diseases.

**January 30, 2001:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain the structural strength of its transport trailers.

**September 27, 2000:** According to its Web site, the Butler County Health Department in Missouri cited Carson & Barnes for two health code violations.

**September 2000:** According to the September/October 2000 edition of *The White Tops*, Carson & Barnes leases a single elephant to Roberts Bros. Circus and a single elephant to Circus Vargas. Both elephants are kept in solitary confinement. The American Zoo and Aquarium Association's *Guide to Accreditation of Zoological Parks and Aquariums* states, "It is inappropriate to keep highly social female elephants singly."

**August 24, 2000:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to have elephant attendants, handlers, and grooms tested for tuberculosis.

**July 22, 2000:** According to *The Capital*, Carson & Barnes was forced to cancel two shows after Anne Arundel County, Md., fire officials deemed its tent unsafe. The circus tent failed the inspectors' flame-spread test for fire safety and lacked a permit. Inspectors also found problems with exit lightings and signs.

**June 6, 2000:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for mishandling an elephant who was shackled with a leg chain without a protective covering.

**October 13, 1999:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to store food and bedding in a manner that prevents contamination, as well as failure to provide cages for bears that meet minimum space requirements.

**September 6, 1998:** On its Web site, Carson & Barnes announced that its elephant Isa had given birth to a baby elephant named Jennie. According to a USDA inspection report dated September 2, 1998, four days before Jennie's birth, Isa was on the road performing with Carson & Barnes' sister circus, Kelly Miller Circus, in Logansport, Ind. This indicates that Isa was subjected to unnecessary stress associated with the rigors of travel and performing while in advanced stages of pregnancy.

**June 16, 1998:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain transport enclosures for the tigers.

**February 5, 1998:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain structurally sound fencing around exotic hoofed animals, failure to provide adequate

drainage in a muddy water buffalo enclosure, failure to maintain the elephant transport trailers, and failure to provide adequate outdoor housing for the dogs used in circus acts.

**October 28, 1997:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not providing adequate ventilation in the elephant transport trailer. Carson & Barnes was also cited for failure to maintain transport trailers for tigers, a pygmy hippopotamus, llamas, goats, sheep, and other animals, failure to maintain records of acquisition for the elephants, and improper food storage.

**July 1997:** Cindy Machado, a humane investigator with the Marin Humane Society, stated (after an inspection of the circus in Colorado), "This is the worst case of neglect I have seen in my 12 years as an investigator. I watched animals become injured with blood dripping down their legs without being treated. There were ponies and horses with open, draining saddle sores that were still being ridden." Officer Machado also reported snakes in overcrowded cages, elephants with soccer ball-size boils, and a hippopotamus without access to water.

**May 28, 1997:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide adequate ventilation in the elephant transport trailers.

**March 31, 1997:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to make necessary repairs to a tiger transport trailer. The inspector wrote, "One board on exit ramp for tiger trailer is becoming splintered and needs to be replaced to prevent injury to animals' feet." The circus was also cited for failure to provide minimum space and an exercise plan for two dogs used in the show.

**January 4, 1997:** According to an internal USDA document, an elephant named Libby, who is owned by Carson & Barnes Circus, was exposed to Hawthorn Corporation elephants who died of tuberculosis and others who tested positive for tuberculosis.

**October 15, 1996:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide veterinary treatment to more than half of the elephants who needed foot care.

**April 17, 1996:** Carson & Barnes received a letter from the USDA warning it to correct alleged violations of the federal AWA that had appeared on two consecutive inspection reports. The circus had failed to provide an adequate barrier for the elephants.

**April 11, 1996:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain the elephant transport trailer.

**March 4, 1996:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not repairing a barrier fence in the area where elephants are chained and fed. The USDA also cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain rusty cages used for lions and camels, failure to maintain fencing, and failure to maintain the elephant transport trailer.

**December 7, 1995:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain rusty cages used for tigers and lions, failure to maintain the zebra-donkey building, and failure to maintain a barrier fence around the area where elephants are fed.

**September 28, 1995:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not making necessary repairs to a tiger cage.

**August 16, 1995:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide veterinary care to an elephant with an excessive buildup of dead skin and two pot-bellied pigs with overgrown hooves, failure to dispose of expired medication, failure to provide shelter from the elements, failure to maintain a tiger cage, failure to clean water receptacles with an excessive buildup of algae for the giraffe and zebra, poor housekeeping, and failure to maintain records of acquisition.

**May 8, 1995:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to update veterinary care records, failure to provide minimum space and adequate exercise to an African elephant, failure to clean the stall for the pygmy hippopotamus, failure to have adequate ventilation in the elephant transport trailers, failure to provide big cats with sanitary drinking receptacles, and improper food storage.

**May 3, 1995:** According to an affidavit given to a USDA investigator, a woman attending the circus with her daughter and a friend observed an employee of Carson & Barnes Circus kick an elephant in the face and stab two elephants with a knife as the elephants tried to reach for hay, causing one elephant to scream and squeal.

**February 23, 1995:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain cages and transport trailers.

**February 1, 1995:** A Carson & Barnes tiger escaped and was missing for 10 days, evoking panic in Hugo, Okla.

**October 26, 1994:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide adequate security to protect an elephant and ensure public safety.

**October 21, 1994:** According to news reports, an elephant named Kay "keeled over" and died while the circus was performing in Taylorville, Ill. Kay had refused to eat or drink for several days. The 58-year-old elephant had not been retired even though she had a history of health problems and kidney infections.

**August 17, 1994:** Carson & Barnes was cited by the USDA for an inadequate program of veterinary care.

**June 24, 1994:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to have an adequate veterinary care program, failure to have a safety barrier between the public and large animals including elephants, giraffes, and camels, failure to maintain a rusty elephant transport trailer with sharp, jagged edges, and improper food storage.

**June 23, 1994:** According to the *Kearney Hub*, two reporters observed Carson & Barnes animal handlers kicking and cursing at a pygmy hippopotamus and striking an elephant across the left eye with a bull hook, a giraffe repeatedly jumping from one end of his cage to the other, and a zebra continually bobbing his head and pacing from side to side.

**March 9, 1993:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to maintain the elephant barn, for inadequate drainage in the giraffe pen, and for a filthy zebra pen.

**October 7, 1992:** The USDA cited Carson & Barnes for failure to provide shelter from the elements, failure to provide minimum space to a pygmy hippopotamus.

liger, and tiger housed together in enclosures that were so narrow that the animals were unable to turn around freely, inadequate pest control for the pygmy hippopotamus plagued by swarms of flies, and failure to record veterinary treatment for a wounded rhinoceros.

**April 26, 1991:** According to USDA telephone conversation records, one Carson & Barnes giraffe died of hypothermia and shock in 1989, and a second giraffe died in 1990 of a possible neck injury during transport when the vehicle swerved to avoid an accident.

**May 1982:** Five elephants tried to escape from the circus in Sallisaw, Okla. One elephant was killed during this incident.

**Circus Pages** has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Circus Pages for failure to have records of veterinary care, provide animals with sufficient space, and provide animals with appropriate food. Circus Pages travels with several animals, including two African elephants named Bombi and Daisy. Both elephants were captured in the wild in 1974. Contact PETA for documentation.

**Animals used in recent acts: elephants, ponies, big cats, and a camel.**

**January 9, 2002:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to comply with minimal veterinary care requirements. Four elephant handlers had not been tested for tuberculosis. The USDA requires annual testing of elephants and handlers because an outbreak of a human strain of tuberculosis has been infecting and killing elephants in captivity.

**September 2, 2001:** According to *High Point Enterprise*, Circus Pages failed to show for a scheduled appearance at the National Guard Armory near High Point, N.C.

**February 11, 1999:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for animal transport enclosures that were in need of repair. The inspector stated, "On the inside of the elephants' transport trailer, the left side of the wall has broken metal and two protruding bolts that must be corrected because they could cause injury to the elephants."

**January 5, 1999:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failing to provide adequate veterinary care for the animals. Simba, an exotic cat, had a bleeding lesion on her chin. There was also no record of routine veterinary care such as deworming, vaccination, and tuberculosis tests.

**August 27, 1998:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to provide shelter for the animals, have records for the camels, and provide adequate veterinary care. The elephants had not been tested for tuberculosis. A lioness was noted to be squinting and holding her eye shut—possibly due to an injury. The USDA inspector stated, "This is a notice that you have had the same violation documented on the last two inspections. You are being given the opportunity to correct these violations. If similar violations are documented on subsequent inspections, all past and future violations may be used as evidence for formal legal action against you."

**June 11, 1998:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to have records of acquisition and disposition of its animals.

**March 19, 1998:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to have records for its animals.

**January 15, 1998:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to provide adequate space for the animals. The lion could not stand up in his travel cage, and the elephants' enclosure did not provide enough space. The circus was also cited for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. The elephant Bombi had a chronic draining abscess on her throat. There were no records of veterinary examinations or recommendations for this problem. The lion was noted as being thin and in need of veterinary care. The llama was observed with overgrown lower incisors.

**January 30, 1997:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failing to make the animals available for inspection. The inspector stated, "Letters from USDA stating the need for submission of itineraries, and the delinquency of such submissions, have been sent on November 2, 1994, March 11, 1996, and April 25, 1996. There was no response to the last requests. The licensee has repeatedly failed to make the animals and facilities available for inspection by not notifying us of the facility's location and has repeatedly failed to provide information requested (itinerary)."

**January 10, 1995:** The USDA cited the circus for failure to have records of veterinary care, to provide adequate food to the big cats, and to provide the elephant Bombi—who could only stand due to a restrictive neck chain—with enough space to lie down in the travel trailer.

**December 5, 1994:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for enclosures that were in disrepair and dangerous for the animals.

**January 6, 1994:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to provide shade to the lions, including a 5-month-old cub.

**December 29, 1992:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to provide veterinary care and medical records. The inspector noted that both elephants' feet were in need of trimming and the nails were cracked and peeling [unattended foot problems in elephants are dangerous and can result in death]. One elephant, Bombi, had a chronic abscess on her throat.

**September 10, 1992:** The USDA cited Circus Pages for failure to have records of veterinary care.



**Clyde Brothers Johnson Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established by the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Clyde Brothers Johnson Circus for an expired program for veterinary care and failure to provide veterinary care to their elephant.**

**May 23, 2001:** The Program for Veterinary Care is required to be updated annually. The circus's program, dated 2/09/00, is out of date and includes elephants no longer with the program.

Tigers are being fed racing dog food, predominantly ground beef, supplemented by K-Zyme feline vitamin powder. Since not an exotic feline diet, the veterinarian must provide a written approved diet plan.

**November 23, 1999:** The circus's sole elephant, Judy, has a mature cataract in her right eye. Medical records indicate several years since Judy's last ophthalmologist exam. Judy needs a current eye exam to monitor the cataract.

**Franzen Bros. Circus** has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Franzen Bros. Circus for failure to provide veterinary care, for failure to meet nutritional requirements, for unsanitary conditions, and for repeatedly failing to maintain transport trailers. A tiger attacked and killed Wayne Franzen during a performance. Brian Franzen was convicted of cruelty to animals when several emaciated ponies were confiscated from a filthy trailer. Franzen Bros. Circus leases animal acts to other circuses, including Sterling & Reid Circus\* and Royal Hanneford Circus.\* Contact PETA for documentation.

**Animals used in recent acts: elephants and exotic cats.**

**February 4, 2002:** Franzen Bros. was cited for failure to allow a USDA official access to animals, records, and property for the purpose of conducting an animal welfare inspection.

**August 1, 2001:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to provide two tigers with minimum space. The cages were too small to allow them to make normal postural and social adjustments with adequate freedom of movement.

**May 9, 2001:** A USDA inspector noted that tuberculosis test results for trunk wash cultures from its elephants had not been received for the 2001 season.

**October 5, 2000:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to maintain the transport trailer.

**February 22, 1999:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to maintain transport trailers, including one used for the lions and tigers that had been severely damaged after it was hit by a truck.

**January 25, 1999:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to maintain transport trailers in a manner that protects the elephants from injury.

**October 16, 1998:** According to *The Press-Enterprise* (Riverside, Calif.), "In a plea bargain agreement, [Brian] Franzen, 23, was ordered to pay \$1,287 in restitution and was placed on probation for three years ... after pleading guilty to two counts of keeping his animals in filthy trailers. He also agreed to allow any law enforcement officer to inspect his animals without a warrant. ... [On April 3] Officials from the Humane Society of San Bernardino Valley claimed the ponies were severely dehydrated, malnourished and living in filth. One animal subsequently died. ..."

**October 3, 1998:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. The inspector noted that the toenails on the Asian elephant were overgrown and misshapen, with chips and cracks.

**April 28, 1998:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for the second time for failure to have a veterinary care program, meet the nutritional requirements of exotic cats, and to properly maintain a transport trailer for the elephant.

**April 17, 1998:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to have a veterinary care program, meet the nutritional requirements of exotic cats, and properly maintain a transport trailer for the elephant.

**April 3, 1998:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for inadequate cleaning of trailers and cages, failing to submit the required itinerary, inadequate exercise and space, and poorly maintained transport trailers. The trailer used to transport the lions and tigers was placed "out of service" and towed by authorities when it was found to be without trailer brakes.

- Brian Franzen was charged with cruelty to animals by the San Bernardino Humane Society in California after humane investigators found several emaciated ponies in a filthy trailer while Franzen was touring with Sterling & Reid Circus.

**May 8, 1997:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to have a veterinary care program, maintain transport trailers, and keep records of acquisition and disposition.

**May 7, 1997:** Wayne Franzen, the founder and owner of Franzen Bros. Circus, was killed by one of his own tigers in front of 200 schoolchildren and their families in Carrolltown, Pa.

**November 19, 1996:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to maintain transport trailers and for unsanitary conditions in the tiger enclosures.

**September 30, 1996:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to supply the required itinerary.

**September 20, 1996:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failure to supply the required itinerary.

**December 30, 1994:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for failing to keep records of veterinary care, for unsanitary cages (with feces, food waste, and hair buildup), and for using unsafe enclosures for animals.

**February 17, 1994:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for unsanitary cages and unsafe enclosures for animals.

**February 1993:** The USDA cited Franzen Bros. for cages in need of repair and for having no record of veterinary care.

\* Factsheet available.

**George Carden Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited George Carden Circus numerous times for failing to provide shelter from the elements, for inadequate and unsafe enclosures, for failing to provide proper veterinary care, and for failure to properly handle animals. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**June 17, 2002:** Two elephants, named Tory and Mary, performing with the Shrine Circus in Menomonie, Wis., bolted out of a circus tent during a show, scattering crowds. Mary hiked 2 miles through town and was recaptured at the University of Wisconsin-Stout campus when trucks blocked her escape. One child was injured, and the elephants damaged a door at the park and caused \$600 in damage to a city truck. The Shriners had contracted with George Carden Circus for the event.

**May 1, 2001:** According to the Canadian Broadcasting Corp., two George Carden Circus employees pleaded guilty to cruelty to animals charges in provincial court in St. John's, Newfoundland, and each was fined \$200. The charges were brought after investigators found that the bears were kept in filthy, undersized cages for 23 hours a day. The judge stated that he wished the legislation were stronger so that he could penalize the defendants more and suggested that people stay away from the circus.

**April 4, 2001:** The USDA cited George Carden Circus for failure to provide minimum space to a llama who was unable to stand with his head in an upright position, improper food storage, failure to have an exercise plan for its dogs, and inadequate record keeping.

**August 1, 2000:** Each of two George Carden employees was charged by the SPCA with five counts of animal cruelty in Newfoundland, Canada. The alleged offenses include causing unnecessary pain and suffering to five bears, eight ponies, and three elephants and failure to provide water and care for the elephants.

**July 23, 2000:** According to *The Daily News*, the Nova Scotia Department of Natural Resources forced George Carden Circus to leave the province and levied a fine because the circus had brought bears in violation of an ordinance prohibiting bears in circuses. The circus was forced to cancel 10 remaining performance dates and was also fined for failure to have a wildlife import permit.

**June 26-27, 2000:** A Canadian SPCA investigator found eight ponies and three elephants confined to a poorly ventilated trailer for more than seven hours without water. A chain around the leg of one of the elephants lacked sufficient padding to prevent injury. Inadequate space "forced one elephant to take an unnatural posture." The elephants exhibited "extreme signs of abnormal and stressed behavior" prior to loading. Five bears were confined in very small cages for 23 hours per day without water or bedding. The bears' food was contaminated with fecal material. One bear exhibited signs of "abnormal and stressed behavior."

**June 16, 2000:** According to the Canadian Broadcasting Corp., the Stephenville, Newfoundland, fire department's chief stated it was unlikely that the agency would bring the George Carden Circus back again because of controversy over the treatment of animals.

**June 13, 2000:** According to the Canadian Broadcasting Corp., representatives of the provincial diabetes association in Grand Falls-Windsor, Newfoundland, instructed George Carden Circus to remove the organization's name from advertising posters because it was not endorsing the circus.

**June 12, 2000:** According to the Canadian Broadcasting Corp., the St. John's, Newfoundland, City Council voted not to give a license to the George Carden Circus for a June 23-24 booking at Memorial Stadium after viewing videotape of how animals in circuses are trained. The city later put into effect a policy that it will not issue a license to any circus that features exotic or wild animals.

**July 25, 1998:** A USDA veterinarian wrote regarding treatment of the tigers, "Handling of all animals should be done as expeditiously and carefully as possible in a manner that does not cause trauma, overheating, excessive cooling, behavior stress, physical harm, or unnecessary discomfort. Physical abuse shall not be used to train, work, or otherwise handle animals [the groom] picked up a prod and began forcefully and repeatedly poking the animal through the cage bars. The animal was again subjected to another session of abusive prodding by Mr. Skinner. This unprofessional and abusive behavior on the part of the groom is unacceptable."

**April 22, 1998:** The George Carden Circus was in noncompliance with the AWA for failing to have a plan of veterinary care, records of its animals, and records of acquisition, disposition, and transport.

**March 26, 1998:** A USDA inspection revealed that the George Carden Circus was noncompliant with the AWA for veterinary care.

**June 20, 1997:** W.H. Chisholm, D.V.M., observed the following while the George Carden Circus was in Nova Scotia, Canada: "After unloading the three elephants from the trailer, the trainer was in the process of cleaning them when he ordered one of them (Janice) to stay in place. When she did not comply, he used his ankus (a pole with a pointed end and a hook on its side) to grab her inside the mouth and firmly jerk her face toward him as he hollered at her to obey. Next, he ordered her to lie down, at which point she began to urinate (a common stress response in animals). He continued to order her to lie down and roll over on her side in her own urine as she was still in the process of urinating. After he finished hosing her off, he ordered her to get up. Again, she did not comply to his satisfaction, and he subsequently kicked her in the face with force equivalent to what I would use to kick a soccer ball. When the elephants were performing in the ring, I observed the trainer repeatedly driving the pointed end of the ankus into the tissue above the foot of one of the elephants" left hind legs. He continued for eight to 10 times. ... This was done with both hands on the shaft of the ankus and his full body force thrown into the movement. I witnessed the tiger trainer use his black whip on at least six occasions to hit the tigers in the face when they were not performing appropriately in the ring."

**January 4, 1997:** According to an internal USDA document, animals owned by George Carden Circus may have been exposed to Hawthorn Corporation elephants who tested positive for tuberculosis.

**October 16, 1996:** A USDA inspection report cited George Carden Circus for tiger enclosures in need of repair and failure to provide veterinary care for the elephants and goats. The inspector stated, "One female pygmy goat has large swelling on

lower neck and needs a vet examine. Cindy, one elephant, has a history of weight loss. No vet records are present to document treatment that has been done."

**May 23, 1996:** The USDA cited George Carden Circus for failure to have an updated program of veterinary care.

**April 25, 1996:** The USDA cited George Carden Circus for failing to comply with handling regulations.

**March 21, 1995:** A USDA inspection found the George Carden Circus was noncompliant for chemicals being stored with the tiger and elephant food, tigers being fed spoiled meat not fit for consumption, inadequate veterinary care, and elephants being in need of foot care.

**October 6, 1994:** A USDA inspection found George Carden Circus utilizing unsafe enclosures for the animals. The USDA inspector stated, "[N]ails are protruding from the top of enclosures housing dogs."

**March 17, 1994:** A USDA inspection found George Carden Circus noncompliant with the AWA for failure to provide safe travel trailers for the animals. The USDA inspector reported the travel trailers had breaking, rusted metal on the floor that could injure the elephants. The circus was also noncompliant for lack of veterinary care. The USDA inspector stated, "Sheep in petting pen have excessively long hooves that cause animals to walk/stand abnormally."

**March 17, 1993:** A USDA inspector reported, "[D]ogs are in direct sun without access to shade or shelter."

**July 3, 1991:** An inspection was completed by Dr. Ken Langelier with the SPCA in Canada. The following was observed by Dr. Langelier: "The bears performed a bicycle-riding act and were led on leashes and wore muzzles. The only exercise was on a leash for performance. The bears urinated and defecated in their cages. No toys or other materials for psychological stimulation were provided to any of the bears. All elephants were in chains in full sun with no water available. The trainer was not available, but the stallions were kept in almost full sun, and food and water were not available. For "working animals," it is unfortunate they do not earn the right to larger holding facilities, psychological stimulation such as toys, exercise, and easier work schedule with less frequent transportation. The economics of circuses will never provide this, so it is unfortunate that these animals must continue to entertain people while remaining in sub-optimal condition."

**Georgina Donohoe has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Georgina Donohoe whose elephants are used in Plunkett Brothers Circus for failure to maintain transport trailer.**

**October 10, 1998:** A corner of a piece of sheet metal protrudes to pose a laceration hazard in the elephant compartment in the transport trailer.

The same trailer has two boards that have become rough and jagged at the ends.

**October 27, 1998:** Repairs to elephant transport trailer had not been completed. Repairs to transport trailer were reported to be completed in January 28, 2000.

**Hanneford Family Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Hanneford Family Circus numerous times for failure to provide a veterinary care program and veterinary care records, as well as failure to provide proper food and secure enclosures. A Hanneford Family Circus elephant caused the death of a handler. Animals with Hanneford Family Circus are forced to perform up to three times per day, seven days a week, year-round at the Fort Lauderdale Swap Shop in Florida. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**Animals used in recent acts: 3 elephants, 2 tigers, and a dog.**

**September 27, 2001:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to provide adequate drainage around the tiger enclosure. The inspector wrote, "[T]he water has a foul odor and is not being rapidly drained." The inspector also noted that the tiger named Jumanji "appear[ed] thin."

**November 23, 1999:** The circus failed to renew its USDA exhibitor license and had to reapply for a new license.

**December 1, 1998:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to feed a balanced diet to its tiger. The inspector wrote, "The diet for the young tiger is significantly out of the accepted calcium/phosphorus ratio." The circus was also cited for storing toxic substances near the animals' hay, failure to have a veterinary care program, and incomplete acquisition records.

The inspector recommended that all personnel in contact with the elephants be tested for tuberculosis yearly.

**February 6, 1998:** Hanneford Family Circus was cited for inadequate record keeping.

**January 13, 1998:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. There were no current records of vaccinations, dewormings, foot care, or treatment for an elephant named Liz with an elbow problem.

**July 1, 1997:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not having a program of veterinary care.

The circus was also cited for a tiger cage in disrepair, inadequate record keeping, and failure to provide health certificates for animals brought from Florida to Iowa.

**December 11, 1996:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not having a program of veterinary care.

**September 30, 1996:** The USDA found that Hanneford's perimeter fence was not secure and strong enough to prevent animals from escaping, endangering both the animals and the general public. The circus was also cited for not having records of veterinary care and insufficient record keeping.

**June 13, 1996:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to have a



veterinary care program.

**February 28, 1995:** Hanneford Family Circus was cited for improper food storage and waste disposal.

**April 29, 1993:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for failure to maintain veterinary care records. There were no current records of dewormings, vaccinations, or visits from a veterinarian. The circus was also cited for incomplete disposition records and improper feeding.

**December 1, 1992:** The USDA cited Hanneford Family Circus for insufficient watering, improper waste disposal, poor housekeeping, and inadequate pest control.

**September 13, 1991:** The USDA issued an official warning to Hanneford Family Circus for repeated failure to provide access to records and property, failure to provide required itinerary, and failure to maintain adequate records.

**June 20, 1990:** An elephant named Carol knocked down a handler, knelt down on his chest, and stepped on his head and leg. The handler died of multiple trauma and crushing injuries. The incident occurred as the elephants were being prepared for a performance at the Thunderbird Swap Shop. Carol is still with the Hanneford Family Circus and is believed to be giving rides to children.

**Hawthorn Corporation** has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Hawthorn Corporation numerous times for failure to provide veterinary care, adequate shelter from the elements, and proper food and water, as well as failure to handle animals in a manner that prevents trauma and harm and ensures public safety. Hawthorn has accumulated \$72,500 in USDA penalties and has twice had its license suspended. Four of Hawthorn's elephants died from a human strain of tuberculosis. In January 1997, Hawthorn's herd of 18 elephants was restricted from traveling during tuberculosis treatment. Hawthorn's elephants have rampaged, causing death, injury, and property damage. Hawthorn leases animals to facilities and circuses around the world, including Jordan World Circus, Circus Vargas, Shrine Circuses, Walker Bros. Circus, Royal Palace Circus, George Carden Circus, Hanneford Circus, Hamid Circus, Alain Zerbini, and Tarzan Zerbini. Contact PETA for documentation.

**October 19, 2002:** According to *The Virginian-Pilot*, an elephant handler with Sterling & Reid, David Creech, was convicted on three counts of animal cruelty (see September 4-5, 2002) and fined \$200 on each count. The judge acquitted Creech, a Hawthorn employee, of a fourth count, which alleged that he struck an elephant over the head with a bull hook, because it was unclear from the eyewitness account which elephant trainer committed the act.

**September 4-5, 2002:** According to *The Virginian-Pilot*, an elephant handler with Sterling & Reid, David Creech, was charged with four counts of animal cruelty for beating an elephant until her hide was bloody while performing at the Norfolk Scope on August 23. The article stated, "An investigation by the officer and an outside veterinarian determined that the elephant suffered multiple lacerations."

The circus is leasing its elephant act from Hawthorn. Another elephant handler, James Zajicek, a Hawthorn employee, was arrested and charged with obstructing justice.

**June 1, 2002:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide adequate veterinary treatment to three elephants held in the protected contact area and in need of foot care to prevent potentially deadly foot problems. Hawthorn was also cited for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not providing diagnostic test results for a dead lion and a dead tiger.

The inspector noted that 13 white tigers had been kept in transport cages since April 23, 2002, which failed to comply with minimum space requirements.

Lota was reported to weigh 7,200 pounds. The expert elephant veterinary consultant had determined that Lota should not be sent back on the road before reaching a weight of 7,400 pounds.

**May 24, 2002:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to the African elephants with hard, dry, cracked skin on the back, ears, and head and overgrown nails and cuticles, which can lead to potentially deadly foot problems. Hawthorn was also cited for failure to provide minimum space to its tigers and for allowing unauthorized persons near the tiger cages without a handler

present.

**May 16, 2002:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide adequate veterinary treatment to the elephants in the protected contact area and in need of foot care and for failure to provide diagnostic test results for a dead lion and a dead tiger.

**May 4, 2002:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to its elephants. The inspector wrote, "The owner of the Hawthorn Corporation failed to obtain the services of an expert elephant veterinarian as required. [The USDA] acquired the services of an expert elephant veterinary consultant who examined Delhi on this date." The USDA's elephant veterinary consultant found that Delhi had numerous lesions, a swollen tail, swollen front feet with skin damage and abscess blow-outs, abscess defects on the foot pads, and a huge split nail. The consultant recommended twice-daily foot soaks, weekly foot trims, monthly weight checks, oral medications, keeping detailed medical records, providing care for skin wounds, and allowing Delhi to go outside.

The veterinary consultant examined Lota and stated that she should not go on the road until she gained an additional 500 pounds and that the four elephants in the protected contact area--Frieda, Sue, Billy, and Nicholas--had nails and/or cuticles that required trimming.

**April 23, 2002:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care and for causing behavioral stress, physical harm, and unnecessary discomfort to an elephant named Delhi who had severe tissue damage to the front feet and several abscessed areas on her body, including areas on both hips, between the eyes, the anterior portion of the ear attachment, on her head, the elbows of both front legs, and the tail. Chemical burns on Delhi's feet were the result of the use by trainer John Caudill III--who was later fired--of undiluted formaldehyde to soak Delhi's feet. On March 4, 2002, Delhi was found "in a serious health emergency." Both of her front legs were twice their normal size and were swollen up to her chest. She could not bend her front legs at the elbows, was reluctant to bear weight on her front legs, and had difficulty in walking. The attending veterinarian did not respond in a timely manner. The inspector wrote, "The attending veterinarian cannot wait for two to three days before going to the premises to evaluate an acutely ill animal." The USDA determined that a USDA-chosen expert elephant veterinarian was needed to evaluate Delhi's condition.

The USDA also cited Hawthorn for failure to provide diagnostic records, treatment records, and necropsy reports for a tiger named Java and a lion named Bunda, failure to provide minimum space to 14 white tigers living in transport cages, and failure to have a sufficient number of adequately trained employees.

**February 22, 2002:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to properly clean and sanitize the elephants' transport trailer.

**December 19, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to maintain an elephant transport trailer in a manner to prevent injury to the animals.

**October 27, 2001:** Two Hawthorn elephants named Debbie and Judy rampaged at the Word of Life Church in Charlotte, N.C. Two church members were nearly

trampled, and children had to be quickly ushered to safety. The elephants crashed into the church through a glass window, broke and buckled walls and door frames, and knocked a car 15 feet, causing an estimated \$75,000 in damages. The elephants suffered cuts and bruises. Debbie had rampaged twice before with an elephant named Frieda while she was with the Clyde Beatty-Cole Bros. Circus. In May 1995, she smashed windows, dented cars, and crashed through a plate-glass window at a Sears Auto Center in Hanover, Pa., causing \$20,000 in property damage. In July 1995, Debbie bolted from the circus tent in Queens, N.Y., crushing parked cars and triggering a panic that left 12 people injured.

**October 11-15, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct previously identified violations of not providing veterinary care and not maintaining facilities.

An elephant named Lota had been returned to the Illinois compound two months earlier in an emaciated state, with a lump on her left hip. The property manager and trainer stated that they had never seen Lota so thin. The lump had expanded into a large, painful, fluid-filled abscess that extended down to her mid-thigh. Lota and four other elephants (Misty, Queenie, Minnie, and Lottie) were being given tuberculosis medication as a "preventative treatment." Lota and Misty were both in need of foot care. Lota had not been weighed since 1997. There were no veterinary care records for these animals.

The inspector found several bottles of medication, said to be used on the elephants, that had no labels identifying the contents, instructions for use, or expiration date.

Hawthorn was also cited for failure to maintain the structural strength of the elephant barn and improper food storage.

**October 11, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not providing veterinary care by an experienced veterinarian to elephants traveling with Walker Bros. Circus. The inspector wrote, "I spoke with the veterinarian ... that had examined the animals on 10/10/01. He stated that he was not sure about the proper treatment for the elephants because he did not have much experience [in] treating them."

**October 5, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct previously identified violations of not providing veterinary care and security for its elephants traveling with Walker Bros. Circus.

Delhi had an open, draining, and bleeding wound on her nail with blood stains on and around the nail and foot. The area above the nail was swollen and warm to the touch. The cuticles on both of her front feet were "very overgrown." Delhi was limping in pain and favored her leg during the performance. There were no documents to indicate that a qualified person was providing foot care. Tess' left eye was very teary, and she was squinting; the trainer claimed that he had run out of an antibiotic ointment to treat her eye. Two bottles of expired medication were found by the inspector.

The inspector also observed that an experienced elephant handler was not present while the public came near elephants walking freely in a pen. The inspector returned later, after the report had been discussed with the licensee, and again found that the elephants were loose and unattended.

**October 2, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care to three elephants (Liz, Delhi, and Tess, traveling with Walker Bros. Circus) with

overgrown nails and cuticles. Hawthorn was also cited for failure to have dangerous animals under the control of experienced handlers. The inspector observed parents and children approaching and petting elephants while no attendant was present.

Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide structurally sound enclosures. The inspector wrote, "[T]he elephants were inside an orange plastic mesh 'fence.' It was down in two places. ... [Local authorities] informed me that earlier in the day, at least one [elephant] was outside this enclosure. Two [elephants] were completely free from any restraint. ... A water hose was running water over an electrical cord. This area was able to be touched by both elephants and the public."

**October 1, 2001:** The Harlan County Society for Prevention of Cruelty to Animals in Kentucky lodged a complaint with a county judge after observing that Hawthorn elephants with Walker Bros. Circus had "numerous red and raw spots on their ears from being speared with the hook-like device the trainer uses. ... The traveling quarters for the animals were at best cramped and inadequate. And at no time did I see any water dish or clean food be provided for any of the ... elephants."

**September 25, 2001:** Hawthorn was cited for improper food storage.

**July 11, 2001:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to correct previously identified violations of not disposing of expired medications and not making necessary repairs to the barn.

Hawthorn was also cited for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to three elephants with excessively overgrown nails.

**June 27, 2001:** During an inspection conducted at Walker Bros. Circus, Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to four elephants with "excessive pad and toenail overgrowth on their feet" and overgrown cuticles. The inspector wrote, "It does not appear that these animals have had proper foot care in a significant amount of time."

Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to an elephant named Lota who was "excessively thin, with a protruding spine and hip bones." The inspector wrote, "It appears that she has lost a significant amount of weight."

The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to have dangerous animals under the control of experienced handlers and failure to have adequate safety barriers. The inspector observed members of the public approaching the elephants and being loaded on an elephant for rides while no handler was present.

**June 26, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for physically abusing elephants. The inspector observed the handler gouge an elephant named Ronnie on the trunk with a bull hook, causing an open lesion, and a different handler was "observed raking the back of another elephant several times with his hook during the performance."

**May 23, 2001:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide records of acquisition. The inspector also noted that Misty had an abscess on her left front foot and that her feet were in need of trimming.

**April 13, 2001:** A letter to the editor published in the *Chicago Sun-Times* stated, "I escorted a group of schoolchildren, including my 8-year-old daughter, to this year's Medinah Shrine Circus. ... When the elephants were brought behind the curtain, the trainer began verbally abusing and hitting the elephant. We watched in horror as he swung a stick with all his force and struck the elephant in the back of the leg. This must have hurt because the elephant let out a scream that could be heard throughout the UIC Pavilion. The kids were frightened and asked me why the man was hurting the elephant."

According to documents from the city of Chicago, a cruelty to animals complaint was filed against trainer John Caudill, a Hawthorn employee. The elephants used at Medinah Shrine Circus were leased from Hawthorn.

**March 29, 2001:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to an elephant named Delhi traveling with Walker Bros. Circus. Delhi had an injury on her left front foot. The inspector wrote, "The lesion is open and bleeding today and should be evaluated by a veterinarian."

**March 1, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not disposing of expired medications. Hawthorn was also cited for failure to maintain a tiger enclosure with an "extremely rusty shift door with sharp metal edges" and an "excessively chewed/clawed" wood partition. Hawthorn was cited for inadequate ventilation in a barn with "an extremely strong urine odor."

The inspector noted that a 12-year-old white male tiger named Neve died while being transported back to winter quarters and that a 6-year-old white female tiger named Java died in June 2000.

**February 23, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not repairing damages to a trailer used to transport tigers.

**July 11, 2000:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct a previously identified violation of improper feeding of its tigers. Hawthorn was also cited for a trailer in disrepair.

**June 6, 2000:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to dispose of expired medications, improper food storage, and failure to maintain the structural strength of a tiger enclosure with a rusted wall and sharp, exposed edges.

**May 21, 2000:** According to the *Hanover Sun*, Cuneo put a killer elephant named Freda back on tour with a traveling circus in defiance of a USDA directive that she posed an "unacceptable risk to public."

**November 16, 1999:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to maintain enclosures in a manner that protects the animals from injury and for storing moldy food.

**August 18, 1999:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to have annual tuberculosis tests for the elephant handlers.

**July 9, 1999:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care to an elephant named Lota who had a "large open wound on the right hip area." The inspector wrote, "During the inspection the left side of the wound was weeping and bloody."

**June 16, 1999:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to have a veterinarian-approved diet plan for the tigers, handle food in a manner that prevents contamination, and submit the required itinerary.

**May 11, 1999:** The USDA denied Hawthorn's request to use an elephant named Frieda in public exhibition, stating that she posed an "unacceptable risk to public, and therefore her own, safety." Frieda had rampaged several times while touring with Clyde Beatty-Cole Bros. Circus.

**March 16, 1999:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide proper veterinary care. The inspector noted that a tiger was administered medication that had expired. Hawthorn was also cited for improper and moldy food storage.

**November 26, 1998:** In an interview, published in *The Evansville Courier*, with Hawthorn tiger trainer Othmar Vohringer, he recalled a serious attack: "A lion took my arm off. It was just hanging there. It had to be reattached."

**November 12, 1998:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to follow the veterinary care program.

**May 18, 1998:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care to a tiger named Bulba who was extremely thin. The inspector also found several outdated medications, improper and moldy food storage, and unsanitary housekeeping.

**May 13-17, 1998:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. An elephant had an accumulation of necrotic skin and abrasions. All elephants were in need of foot care, skin care, and exercise. The condition of the animals suggested that they had been housed in the transport trailer for an extended period of time.

The inspector observed blood and bloodstains on an elephant's face and earflap.

The animals did not have access to water. When the inspector instructed the handler to offer water, two elephants drank continuously from a bucket for eight minutes and two others drank continuously for five minutes.

**April 7, 1998:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for improper maintenance of transport trailers.

**March 16, 1998:** Cuneo agreed to a fine of \$60,000 and a 45-day license suspension to settle USDA charges that his company mistreated elephants after two of his elephants died of tuberculosis in August 1996.

**February 26, 1998:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to have an adequate veterinary care program and a written contingency plan for elephant escapes.

**November 20-21, 1997:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failing to provide veterinary care. The tuberculosis treatment protocol prescribed for the elephants was not being followed. The inspector also found improper food storage and poor housekeeping.

**October 9, 1997:** Hawthorn was cited for improper food storage.

**September 16, 1997:** The U.S. Department of Labor Occupational Safety and Health Administration informed Hawthorn that an inspection "disclosed the following potential hazard: Employees were exposed to the *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* when they worked around elephants infected with tuberculosis. ... [T]his letter serves as notification of the likelihood of transmission of tuberculosis from elephants to employees."

**July 23, 1997:** The USDA filed charges against Hawthorn, alleging it continued exhibiting tigers in Albuquerque, N.M., while its license was suspended.

**April 10, 1997:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failing to provide veterinary care. The inspector noted that the tuberculosis treatment and testing protocol prescribed for the elephants by the American Association of Zoo Veterinarians was not being followed. Hawthorn was also cited for failing to maintain structures.

**February 6, 1997:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide veterinary care. The inspector wrote, "Lota is extremely thin and eyes appear to be sunken in." The inspector also found outdated medication.

The USDA suspended Hawthorn's license for 21 days after the exhibitor attempted to export a baby elephant named Nickolaus to Puerto Rico despite the fact that the animal had tested positive for tuberculosis.

**January 4, 1997:** An internal USDA document contained a list identifying facilities with animals who were at risk of tuberculosis due to exposure to Hawthorn's elephants: Gary Johnson's elephant compound, Utica Zoo, Catskill Game Farm, Pittsburgh Zoo, Walker Bros. Circus, Alain Zerbini, Tarzan Zerbini, George Carden Circus, Carson & Barnes Circus, Heritage Zoo, and Riddle's Elephant Farm.

**January 1997:** Hawthorn's herd of elephants was prohibited by the USDA from traveling, and Cuneo was not permitted to introduce a breeding bull into the tuberculosis-infected herd. Fourteen of the 18 elephants were considered at high risk of being infected.

**November 12, 1996:** Cuneo rejected an offer to send a 45-year-old elephant named Lota to a sanctuary. The Milwaukee Zoo donated Lota to Cuneo in 1990 despite a public outcry. The publicized transport depicted Lota being beaten onto a trailer, falling, and urinating blood. Lota was subsequently leased to circuses, contracted tuberculosis, and became emaciated.



**October 22, 1996:** Florida health officials obtained a court injunction to stop Liz and Lota, two Hawthorn elephants who were traveling with Walker Bros. Circus, from entering the state because they were infected with tuberculosis.

**August 29, 1996:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to properly store food and maintain records of acquisition and disposition.

**August 28, 1996:** According to an internal USDA memo, four Hawthorn employees tested positive for tuberculosis.

**August 15, 1996:** USDA Acting Deputy Administrator Ron DeHaven wrote regarding discovery of a human strain of tuberculosis in Hawthorn's elephants, "[T]he state of New Mexico has told Hawthorn to leave the state or be quarantined. \$ There are huge epidemiological considerations, too, since Cuneo buys, sells, trades, and moves elephants like a livestock market."

**August 6, 1996:** A 26-year-old Hawthorn elephant named Hattie, who was leased to Circus Vargas and gave rides to children just prior to her death, died of tuberculosis while being transported from California to Illinois.

**August 3, 1996:** A 35-year-old Hawthorn elephant named Joyce, who was leased to Circus Vargas and gave rides to children until her death, died under anesthesia for a dental exam. She was anesthetized against the advice of a veterinarian who felt the procedure was too risky for an animal in such a debilitated state. Joyce was 1,000 pounds underweight, and 80 percent of her lung tissue had been destroyed by tuberculosis.

**July 18, 1996:** A Hawthorn white tiger bit the hand of a carnival worker while performing at the Orange County Fair in Middletown, N.Y.

**July 17, 1996:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care and proper food and to maintain records on the animals.

**June 21, 1996:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care.

**June 18, 1996:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide veterinary care. The inspector noted, "Lack of records demonstrating observation and treatment of injury to the skin approximately 2 inches medial to Misty's [elephant's] left eye." The inspector also observed that the current veterinary care program was not being followed and records of acquisition were not maintained.

**June 14, 1996:** A Hawthorn elephant named Misty, who was giving rides to children with Jordan World Circus and was previously identified as "potentially dangerous," knocked down and repeatedly kicked her trainer. One child fell off the elephant during the incident in Casper, Wyo.

**May 10, 1996:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failing to provide access to veterinary

records.

**May 7, 1996:** Hawthorn paid a \$12,500 penalty to settle USDA charges of causing Tyke trauma and harm and of jeopardizing public safety. Police shot Tyke to death on August 20, 1994 after she rampaged and killed her trainer.

**March 27, 1996:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide an adequate veterinary care program and maintain records of acquisition.

**March 25, 1996:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for inadequate housekeeping, pest control, and food storage.

**October 26, 1995:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide adequate shelter and water for the elephants, improper food storage, and failure to submit an itinerary.

**August 21, 1995:** Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide adequate shelter for the elephants.

**July 28, 1995:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for inadequate structural maintenance.

**January 20, 1995:** In an internal USDA document, Acting Deputy Administrator Ron DeHaven identified Hawthorn elephants Sue, Billy, Misty, Tony, and Hattie as "potentially dangerous."

**January 17, 1995:** According to USDA documents, while Michael Pursley worked for Hawthorn, "David Polke instructed Pursley to command Hattie to 'lay down' (*sic*) and then beat Hattie with an ax handle. § [T]rainers also used water and food deprivation and electric shock from a cattle prod on the elephants. § [H]e witnessed Tommy Thompson, manager at Cuneo's animal facility at Richmond, Ill., shock (hot shot) an elephant repeatedly for one-half hour in order to get the elephant to lay down (*sic*) and get up upon voice commands."

**December 17, 1994:** A Hawthorn elephant named Dumbo died of tuberculosis.

**October 26, 1994:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care records for an elephant named Amy who had been euthanized. Hawthorn was also cited for inadequate housekeeping and pest control, as well as failure to maintain records of acquisition and disposition.

**September 15, 1994:** Hawthorn was cited for the second time in three months for feeding inedible food to the tigers.

**August 20, 1994:** While performing at the Neal Blaisdell Center in Honolulu, Hawaii, a 20-year-old Hawthorn elephant named Tyke crushed to death her trainer, Allen Campbell, attacked and injured two others, and panicked the crowd, causing several

more injuries. Tyke escaped into the streets of downtown Honolulu during the afternoon rush hour. Over the next hour, police fired 87 bullets into Tyke as she charged after pedestrians and smashed vehicles throughout several blocks. Tyke died of massive nerve damage and hemorrhaging of the brain.

Campbell was described as a "punishment-type" trainer who worked the elephants hard. An autopsy found that he had cocaine and alcohol in his system.

**July 14, 1994:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide a program of veterinary care.

**June 16, 1994:** Hawthorn was cited for feeding inedible food to the tigers.

**May 11, 1994:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for inadequate structural maintenance.

**May 9, 1994:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide a veterinary care program and medical records. Hawthorn was also cited for failure to maintain a transport trailer for the elephants and maintain records of acquisition and disposition.

**February 14, 1994:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide a veterinary care program.

**January 13-14, 1994:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for unsanitary and improper food storage, poor housekeeping, and having outdated medications and dirty water containers.

**July 23, 1993:** An elephant named Tyke ran amok at the North Dakota State Fair in Minot, N.D., trampling and injuring a handler and frightening the crowd as she ran uncontrolled for 25 minutes.

**April 22, 1993:** According to an affidavit obtained by the USDA from circus worker Richard Rosio, Tyke attacked a tiger trainer while the circus was in Altoona, Pa.

**April 21, 1993:** An elephant named Tyke ripped through the front doors of the Jaffa Mosque during a performance and ran out of control for an hour in Altoona, Pa. An estimated 4,500 schoolchildren had to evacuate the building, and the rampage caused more than \$14,000 in damage.

**February 4, 1993:** A Hawthorn employee, Bernhard Rosenquist, was charged with attempted murder, aggravated battery, and armed violence for allegedly stabbing a coworker. Rosenquist was also wanted by federal authorities as a probation violator and by the Lake County, Ill., authorities on burglary charges.

**June 21, 1988:** According to USDA and Canadian law enforcement documents, while a Hawthorn elephant named Tyke was performing with Tarzan Zerbini Circus, "The elephant handler was observed beating the single-tusk African elephant in public to the point [where] the elephant was screaming and bending down on three

legs to avoid being hit. Even when the handler walked by the elephant after this, the elephant screamed and veered away, demonstrating fear from his presence." The handler was John Caudill (a.k.a. John Walker of Walker Bros. Circus) who admitted to "disciplining" Tyke after she hit Caudill's brother and put a hole in his back with her tusk.

**May 28, 1981:** An 11-year-old Hawthorn elephant named Tina, with a one-year history of weight loss, died under anesthesia and was found to have tuberculosis.

**1978:** A Hawthorn Corporation elephant performing in Chicago with the Shrine Circus picked up her trainer with her trunk and threw him into a pillar, killing him.

**Kelly Miller Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Kelly Miller Circus for failure to handle animals in a manner that is safe to the animals and the public, failure to provide veterinary records, and failure to provide structurally sound enclosures. Kelly Miller Circus leases animals from its sister circus, Carson & Barnes. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**Animals used in recent acts: elephants, bears, a chimpanzee, a camel, and a llama.**

**October 4, 2001:** Kelly Miller chimpanzee exhibitor Eduardo Steeples was cited by the USDA for inadequate ventilation, failure to provide minimum space for the chimpanzee stored in a cage that measured only 5'x4'x6', improper social grouping and failure to provide environment enrichment for a chimpanzee kept in solitary confinement, and failure to protect four bears from temperature extremes.

The inspector wrote, "The temperature in Billy Joe's [chimpanzee's] enclosure ... was 95 degrees with 65 percent humidity levels. ... [Billy Joe] is singly housed and cannot see or hear another nonhuman primate. ... This is not in accordance with currently accepted professional standards. ... The cage was barren except for a basketball. ... One of the bears was observed panting during the inspection. The temperature in the enclosure ... was recorded at 95 degrees, with humidity levels of 63 percent. Within several minutes of entering the enclosure, I began perspiring and felt discomfort."

The inspector noted that foods necessary to provide the bears with a nutritionally complete diet were not available.

**August 8, 2001:** Three bears used in the Kelly Miller Circus during its 2000 tour were found malnourished by a deputy in a trailer near Oklahoma City, Okla. The bears were severely emaciated and dehydrated with bloody paws from pacing across fiberglass flooring. The trainer, Aleksandr Sergeivich Shelkovnikov, was charged with one felony count of cruelty to animals and four misdemeanors. The owner of the animal park where they were transported believes they were trained using electric shock.

**April 13, 2001:** A circusgoer filed a complaint with the Mountain Home, Ark., police department after seeing the Kelly Miller elephant handler abuse an elephant. According to the police report, an eyewitness gave this account: "I was standing at the elephant's side at the Shrine Circus, talking to the handler. The animal was obeying all that he was told. It looked to me like the elephant sneezed. The handler turned around and struck the elephant so hard, it drew blood; [the elephant] let out a sad sound and backed up. It shocked me to see the man treat such an animal with such cruelty."

**June 2000:** The Baltimore County Fire Department refused to issue a permit to Kelly Miller because its tent failed to meet state and county inflammability requirements. The circus was forced to cancel performances in Reisterstown, Md.

**January 5, 2000:** The USDA cited Kelly Miller for failure to maintain transport trailers in a manner that protects the animals from injury.

**April 17, 1998:** According to a USDA inspection, Kelly Miller failed to handle animals in a manner that is safe to both the animals and the general public.

**October 9, 1997:** The USDA cited Kelly Miller for failing to have a plan for veterinary care.

**September 1997:** In the Chicago area, 470 letters were sent to the Naper Settlement, a sponsor of the Kelly Miller Circus, asking that it discontinue support of the circus due to the mistreatment of the animals.

An investigator with Illinois Animal Action witnessed a handler strike an elephant 25 times in a half-hour while giving rides to the public.

**January 4, 1997:** According to an internal USDA document, an elephant named Libby, who is owned by Carson & Barnes Circus was exposed to Hawthorn Corporation elephants who died of tuberculosis and others who tested positive for tuberculosis. Kelly Miller Circus leases Libby from its sister circus, Carson & Barnes.

**March 1996:** The USDA cited Kelly Miller Circus for failing to provide structurally sound enclosures for the animals.

**May 1994:** According to an article in the *Dayton Daily News*, a woman saw a trainer strike an elephant in the face with a rod.

**September 1992:** The USDA cited Kelly Miller Circus for not having any records of veterinary care.

**Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). Ringling paid \$20,000 to settle U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) charges of failing to provide veterinary care to a dying baby elephant. The USDA has also cited Ringling for failure to possess records of veterinary care, failure to provide animals with sufficient space, failure to provide animals with exercise, and endangering tigers who were nearly baked alive in a boxcar because of poor maintenance of their enclosures. In less than two years, two baby elephants died, a caged tiger was shot to death, a horse who was used despite a chronic medical condition died during Ringling's traditional animal march, and a wild-caught sea lion was found dead in her transport container. Of the 60 elephants touring with Ringling and kept at its Florida compounds, 44 were captured in the wild. At least 18 elephants have died since 1992. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**December 22, 2002:** A 57-year-old endangered Asian elephant named King Tusk was euthanized because of osteoarthritis. Captivity-induced foot problems and arthritis are the leading reasons for euthanasia of captive elephants.

**November 7, 2002:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to have four elephants tested for tuberculosis. The inspector wrote, "TB is a disease that is dangerous to both man and animals. Animals must be tested in a timely manner for their protection as well as for their handlers." Ringling was also cited for failure to store food in a manner that protects it from contamination.

**October 6, 2002:** Veterinarian Gretchen Steininger, hired by Ringling to provide medical care and defend its use of animals, as reported in the *Macomb Daily*, while the circus was in Michigan, was fined \$500 and reprimanded for negligence and incompetence by the Michigan Department of Consumer & Industry Services on June 22, 2002.

**September 26, 2002:** According to *The Salt Lake Tribune*, a Ringling acrobat was arrested and jailed in Idaho on charges of sexual battery against a 16-year-old girl. The acrobat allegedly dragged the victim back into his sleeping quarters, slammed the door, and assaulted her. The U.S. Immigration and Naturalization Service also ordered the acrobat to be held.

**February 21, 2002:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to dispose of expired medication, for improper feeding, and for poor sanitation.

**August 25, 2001:** California humane officers charged Mark Oliver Gebel, son of animal trainer Gunther Gebel-Williams, with cruelty to animals for striking and wounding an endangered Asian elephant with a sharp metal bull hook. Gebel allegedly inflicted the injury when the elephant, named Asia, hesitated before entering the performance ring at the Compaq Center in San Jose, Calif.

**August 24, 2001:** Ringling was fined \$200.00 by the city of San Jose, Calif., for allowing a yak to run at large and cause a public nuisance.

**August 20, 2001:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to provide access for inspection of animals, records, and property at its retirement center.

**August 17, 2001:** According to *The Wichita Eagle*, Ringling failed to secure a date

at the Kansas Coliseum because of concerns about its declining circus attendance.

**June 1, 2001:** A 7-year-old endangered Bengal tiger named Jasmine was euthanized due to chronic renal disease. The circus did not announce this death.

**May 25, 2001:** A 34-year-old endangered Asian elephant named Birka stored at Ringling's breeding compound was euthanized due to abdominal neoplasia. The circus did not announce this death.

**May 6, 2001:** Ringling subjected a tiger in advanced stages of pregnancy to stressful conditions associated with transport. Four tiger cubs were born on the road while the circus was performing in Columbus, Ohio.

**May 3, 2001:** The USDA cited Ringling for improper food storage.

**April 30, 2001:** An endangered Asian elephant died due to marked osteoarthritis. Captivity-induced foot problems and arthritis are the leading reasons for euthanasia in captive elephants. The circus did not announce this death.

**April 12, 2001:** An endangered Asian elephant was euthanized due to "old age." The circus did not announce this death.

**April 8, 2001:** According to *The New York Times*, a Ringling spokesperson admitted that a trainer who had been videotaped tormenting elephants was still on elephant duty.

**March 7, 2001:** An endangered Bengal tiger was euthanized because of tumors in her ear canals and sinuses. The circus did not announce this death.

**February 20, 2001:** The USDA cited Ringling for improper food storage.

**2001:** Ringling's red unit is leasing five elephants, including its star attraction, a male elephant named Bo, from the George Carden Circus. On May 1, 2001, the Canadian Broadcasting Corp. reported that two George Carden Circus employees had pleaded guilty to cruelty to animal charges in provincial court in St. John's, Newfoundland, and that each had been fined \$200. The charges were brought after investigators found bears kept in filthy, undersized cages for 23 hours a day. The judge stated that he wished the legislation were stronger so that he could penalize the defendants more and suggested that people stay away from the circus.

**November 10, 2000:** A Ringling employee was arrested in Rosemont, Ill., after police identified him from a fingerprint left behind when he allegedly mugged an Ohio woman at knifepoint a month earlier. The circus worker, who had been convicted of aggravated burglary and drug abuse in 1989, was suspected of committing a string of recent armed muggings.

**September 7, 2000:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. The inspector wrote, "There is no documentation maintained on elephants that have minor lesions, scars, or abrasions. Records of medical treatment were not available on the camel that recently had both rear feet caught in a train track."

Ringling was also cited for storing the animals' food near toxic substances and failure to maintain transport enclosures that could not be properly cleaned and sanitized.

**September 6, 2000:** The USDA cited Ringling for failing to provide veterinary care to an elephant named Tillie who has been diagnosed with tuberculosis. Tillie, who is owned by Patricia Zerbini, is under the care of Ringling's Williston facility and



commingled with other elephants, which puts them at risk for infection or re-infection. (See December 17, 1998.)

**August 5, 2000:** An endangered Bengal tiger was euthanized due to degenerative osteoarthritis. The circus did not announce this death.

**July 12, 2000:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to provide adequate care in transit, failure to provide drinking water, and failure to maintain transport enclosures. The inspector wrote, "Animals must be visually observed at least every four hours. É Tiger transport vehicle is inaccessible as long as train is in motion. It is not clear if the opportunity to water the tigers every 12 hours is available. Tiger transport design has allowed excessively high temperatures during routine transport. Vent failure pushed these temperatures to a point of immediate danger to the animals."

**July 5, 2000:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to maintain the structural strength of its tiger enclosures. Two tigers had injured themselves attempting to escape cages in which an excessive rise in temperature occurred when faulty vent doors blew shut. One tiger tore at the cage, tearing the track from the door and breaking off a tooth. A tiger in another enclosure suffered an injury above the eye caused by the same faulty vent-door problem.

**June 16, 2000:** USDA spokesperson Jim Rogers told the *Austin American-Statesman* that the agency has two investigations pending against Ringling Bros. for possible AWA violations.

**June 13, 2000:** According to congressional testimony provided by former Ringling Bros. barn man Tom Rider, "[Elephants] live in confinement, and they are beaten all the time when they don't perform properly. ... When I became disturbed about the treatment of the elephants, the continual beatings, including the baby Benjamin, I was told," That's discipline."

**June 10, 2000:** An endangered Asian elephant was euthanized due to degenerative osteoarthritis. Captivity-induced foot problems and arthritis are the leading reasons for euthanizing captive elephants. The circus did not announce this death.

**May 22, 2000:** A horse found suffering from life-threatening colic as the Ringling train was traveling through Pennsylvania had to wait three hours for treatment while employees searched for a large-animal veterinarian.

**April 17, 2000:** In comments submitted to the USDA, Ringling opposes language in the agency's "Draft Policy on Training and Handling of Potentially Dangerous Animals" that reads, "Hot shots, shocking collars, or shocking belts should not be used for training or to handle the animals during exhibition, and any such use will be closely scrutinized. An ankus may not be used in an abusive manner that causes wounds or other injuries."

**February 22, 2000:** Ringling was cited for failure to maintain a transport-shift cage for the tigers because it had a hole in the floor. The USDA also cited Ringling for failure to provide minimum space for the dogs and failure to identify dogs and cats with USDA tags.

**January 28, 2000:** Ringling's attendance fell an estimated 75 percent in the last decade. A Ringling news release stated, "More than 1 million Chicagoland residents and 30 million other Americans visited Ringling Bros. in the last three years [an average of 10 million per year]." In his 1993 book *Two Hundred Years of the American Circus*, circus historian Tom Ogden wrote Ringling was seen by "an

estimated 40 million people annually."

**November 19, 1999:** The *Chicago Tribune* reported, "Last Thursday's performance of Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey Circus at the 16,000-seat Allstate Arena was so small that two of the three rings were playing to rafts of empty seats. Attendees at several other first-week performances reported similarly small houses."

**November 9, 1999:** The USDA cited Ringling (for the second time) for tiger cages in need of repair. The inspector noted an elephant with chronic arthritis was continuously housed on concrete instead of a more comfortable surface such as rubber for large hoofed animals.

A female Asian elephant named Teetchie with a history of thin body condition and who tested positive for tuberculosis on September 11, 1999, was euthanized on October 28, 1999.

**October 28, 1999:** A 52-year-old endangered Asian elephant named Teetchie was euthanized due to multiple joints affected by osteoarthritis and an M. tuberculosis infection of the lung. Captivity-induced foot problems and arthritis are the leading reasons for euthanasia in captive elephants. The circus did not announce this death.

**September 1999:** Two frightened zebras who were tethered together escaped twice from their handler and ran toward a main street while being transferred from the arena between performances in San Jose, Calif.

**July 26, 1999:** Benjamin, a 4-year-old endangered baby elephant who had been removed from his mother before she could teach him to swim, drowned when he stepped into a pond while the circus was traveling through Texas. According to the *Asian Elephant Studbook*, published by the American Zoological and Aquarium Association, Benjamin was removed from his mother when he was only 1 year old.

**May 27, 1999:** The USDA cited Ringling for tiger cages in need of repair and locking mechanisms, as well as for failure to dispose of medications that had expired as far back as February 1996.

**May 11, 1999:** In a letter to Ringling Bros., USDA Deputy Administrator Ron DeHaven wrote, "We have completed our review of the lesions observed on two juvenile elephants, Doc and Angelica, during the inspection of the Center for Elephant Conservation in Polk City, Fla., on February 9, 1999. ... [W]e find that the handling of these two elephants was not in compliance with the Animal Welfare Act regulations. ... We believe there is sufficient evidence to confirm the handling of these animals caused unnecessary trauma, behavioral stress, physical harm, and discomfort to these two elephants."

**February 25, 1999:** According to an internal USDA memo written by an inspector, detailing injuries found on two baby elephants during a February 9, 1999, inspection, "[Ringling veterinarian] Dr. Lindsay was very upset and asked repeatedly why we could not be more collegial and call him before we came. I explained to him that all our inspections are unannounced. ... All Ringling personnel were very reluctant to let us take pictures [of the calves' rope lesions]."

**February 22, 1999:** A horse collapsed and died during Ringling Bros. and Barnum & Bailey's animal march to the Scope Convention Center in Norfolk, Va. A PETA videographer captured the horse's collapse on film despite Ringling workers' attempts to obstruct the camera. Although Ringling claims that a veterinarian is available to its animals 24 hours a day, there was no veterinarian on duty when the horse was in urgent need of medical care. According to the necropsy, Ringling was aware of this animal's delicate condition yet kept him on the road anyway.

**February 9, 1999:** A USDA report indicated wounds on the baby elephants' legs from separating them from their mothers. The report stated, "[T]here were large visible lesions on the rear legs of both Doc and Angelica (baby elephants). When questioned as to the cause of these lesions, it was stated by Mr. Jim Williams and Mr. Gary Jacobson that "these scars were caused by rope burns, resulting from the separation process from the mothers on January 6, 1999." Angelica's lesion appeared as a pink linear scar, approximately 6" long and 1" wide on the right rear leg. The left rear leg also had a scar directly below the cloth leg tie. Both lesions appeared to have been treated with an iodine-based ointment. Angelica also had two linear healing scars on the back of the right hind leg. Doc had a pink scar on the right rear mid-leg area." (Both baby elephants were just under 2 years old when taken from their mothers. In the wild, female elephants remain with their mothers their entire lives and males for up to 15 years.) Tuberculosis tests for one elephant were not available for review. No treatment was instituted for another elephant with positive tuberculosis status.

**December 17, 1998:** Ringling's Williston, Fla., facility was quarantined by the Florida State Health Department because of elephants' having tuberculosis. The facility remains under quarantine as of September 11, 2000.

**December 9, 1998:** A USDA inspector noted on an inspection report that an elephant with confirmed tuberculosis was euthanized. The circus did not announce this death.

The inspector also noted that three elephants did not have adequate shade and that an elephant named Congo had intermittent lameness and what appeared to be hyperkeratosis (a skin condition).

**November 21, 1998:** The *Calgary Herald* reported that the goat Ringling featured in 1980 as a "unicorn" was purchased from serial killer Leonard Thomas Lake. Lake abducted, tortured, raped, and murdered women before committing suicide when he was finally arrested in 1985. The "unicorn" was actually a mutilated goat whose horns had been manipulated to grow in the center of the animal's forehead.

**November 1998:** Three tigers escaped from their cage in a Chicago parking lot. A Ringling handler was hospitalized in serious condition with bite wounds over much of his body when he was attacked by one of the tigers.

**October 7, 1998:** A USDA inspection of Ringling's elephants found three with lameness and one with lacerations on her forehead.

**October 1, 1998:** The USDA cited Ringling for having a damaged transport enclosure for the hippopotamus.

**September 11, 1998:** A USDA inspector noted on an inspection report that three elephants (32-year-old Lechamee, 28-year-old Sofie, and 42-year-old Mini) had suffered from arthritis for at least 12 years.

**September 3, 1998:** According to the *Asian Elephant Studbook*, published by the American Zoological and Aquarium Association, a 40-year-old elephant named Dolly died. Ringling did not announce this death.

**August 31, 1998:** A 12-year-old wild-caught sea lion named Gypsy was found dead in her transport container in Moline, Ill. In the wild, sea lions can live to be 20 years old.

**August 28, 1998:** Ringling was charged by the USDA with AWA violations for the

death of Kenny, a baby endangered Asian elephant forced to perform in Jacksonville, Fla., despite his being sick. The USDA charged the circus with failure to provide veterinary care to Kenny, and Ringling paid \$20,000 to settle the case out of court.

**June 9, 1998:** Ringling was cited by the USDA for failure to provide records of veterinary care for an elephant named Seetna who was euthanized due to prolonged dystocia. According to the *Asian Elephant Studbook*, published by the American Zoological and Aquarium Association, Seetna was 30 years old when she died on May 22, 1996. Dystocia is difficult labor. In elephants, dystocia often indicates that the fetus has died and is decomposing in the uterus. The circus did not announce this death.

**March 26, 1998:** The USDA issued Ringling a "strong letter of warning" for the killing of Arnie, an endangered Bengal tiger. An angry trainer shot Arnie five times with a 12-gauge shotgun while he was locked in his cage.

**March 17, 1998:** The *Mountain Xpress* reported that a Ringling employee, who was on parole after serving seven years on a New York murder conviction, was arrested in connection with two break-ins and liquor theft at an Asheville, N.C., liquor store.

**January 24, 1998:** A 2 1/2-year-old baby elephant named Kenny was forced to perform in two shows while the circus was in Jacksonville, Fla., despite obvious signs of illness. According to the circus's animal care log, Kenny was "not eating or drinking," was "bleeding from his rectum had a hard time standing, was very shaky, walked very slowly," and "passed a large amount of blood from his rectum." The log noted that at 11:30 p.m., "the elephant was dead."

**January 7, 1998:** Ringling trainer Graham Chipperfield shot a Bengal tiger named Arnie five times while he was locked in his cage, killing him in retaliation for an attack against Graham's brother, Richard, during a photo shoot.

**September 5, 1997:** The USDA cited Ringling (for the second time) for improper food storage. The inspector noted that a complaint about a lame elephant could not be verified because "the circus could not allow the elephants to move freely."

**July 24, 1997:** The USDA cited Ringling for unsanitary food storage.

**April 13, 1997:** A Ringling employee was arrested in Worcester, Mass., on a fugitive-from-justice warrant, which listed a charge of counterfeiting.

**February 3, 1997:** The circus was cited for failure to correct a previously identified violation of unsanitary food storage.

**January 21, 1997:** The USDA cited Ringling for inadequate storage of animals' food.

**December 20, 1996:** The USDA cited Ringling for not providing environmental enrichment for primates. The USDA inspector stated, "There is no enhancement plan developed. The primates show signs of stereotypic behaviors (rocking, weaving, shaking, and cage-bar chewing and licking). All primates are housed singly. Cages have no enrichment." Ringling was also cited for not providing adequate space for a baboon. Additionally, the inspector cited Ringling for not providing adequate shelter for a hippo. He stated, "The length of the hippo is greater than the width of the hippo pool."

**August 14, 1996:** The USDA cited Ringling for not giving the elephants tetanus vaccinations, deworming, or fecal exams.

**December 7, 1995:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to maintain tiger cages, failure to provide records of disposition for 10 elephants no longer on the premises, and improper food storage.

**December 5, 1995:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to allow access to its property for an animal welfare inspection.

**September 30, 1995:** A Ringling lion bit off the index finger of a 31-year-old woman attending the circus.

**September 20, 1995:** The USDA cited Ringling for not having a program of veterinary care. There was also no record of tetanus vaccinations.

**June 8, 1995:** The USDA cited Ringling for improper food storage.

**February 14, 1995:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to have an exercise program for the animals, as well as for animal enclosures that were in need of repair.

**1995:** According to the *Asian Elephant Studbook*, published by the American Zoological and Aquarium Association, the following Ringling elephants died: 53-year-old Cita, 53-year-old Ranni, 45-year-old Rhani, and 34-year-old Karnaudi. The circus did not announce these deaths.

**November 19, 1994:** Ringling's vice president of animal care Gunther Gebel-Williams, was arrested in St. Louis and charged with disturbing the peace. Gebel-Williams had screamed at a police officer and threatened the officer with the whip that he uses on his tigers because officers were giving traffic tickets to circus customers.

**November 10, 1994:** The USDA observed that Ringling was storing animal food in an unsanitary manner.

**October 19, 1994:** A Ringling employee in Boston, Mass., was arrested and charged with assault and battery with a dangerous weapon when he stabbed a horse trainer in the stomach with a penknife. A fight had broken out when the employee had tried to get the horses to kick the trainer.

**October 18, 1994:** During a routine USDA inspection, an elephant was being beaten by a Ringling trainer. The USDA inspector stated, "Upon entering facility, I heard yelling and the sound of someone hitting something. I observed an elephant trainer hitting an elephant with the wooden end of the handling tool to get it up." A USDA inspector cited Ringling for failure to handle animals in such a way that there is minimal risk of harm to the animal and the public. Additionally, the inspector reported, "Animals were also being housed by other species that interfere with their health and cause them discomfort."

**August 8, 1994:** According to the *Asian Elephant Studbook*, published by the American Zoological and Aquarium Association, a 41-year-old elephant named Jenny died. Ringling did not announce this death.

**April 19, 1994:** A railroad official testified that a circus-train brake operator who helped conduct a safety inspection just before a deadly Ringling train derailment had failed a drug test after the wreck. A clown and an elephant trainer were killed in the crash.

**January 21, 1994:** A USDA inspector cited Ringling for electrical wires hanging loose inside a lion's cage, causing the potential for injury or death.

**January 17, 1994:** Two Ringling performers were arrested in Post Orange, Fla., and

charged with disorderly intoxication. One of the men was also charged with resisting arrest with violence after he swung at the arresting officer and tried to push the patrol car into the officer.

**December 29, 1993:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to provide minimum space for dogs and for inadequate lighting in the dog enclosure. The boxes were too small "for most dogs to stand, sit, lie, and turn about freely." Ringling was cited for failure to correct previously identified violations of not providing minimum space for bears, including one bear with rub marks; failure to repair the lion cages; and improper food storage.

**December 14, 1993:** The USDA cited Ringling for failure to provide bears with the minimum space required by the federal AWA. Ringling also failed to provide a program for exercise.

**May 6, 1993:** A Ringling elephant killed her trainer in Gainesville, Fla. The elephant knocked down the 51-year-old trainer and stepped on his chest.

**1992:** According to the *Asian Elephant Studbook*, published by the American Zoological and Aquarium Association, the following Ringling elephants died: a 26-year-old male named Petely, 50-year-old Nelly, and 50-year-old Mia.

**1992:** Ringling disposed of five tigers who were of no use to the circus by giving them to New Jersey resident Joan Byron-Marasek, who owns a poorly maintained private menagerie. One of the Ringling tigers killed four other tigers at the facility. Byron-Marasek has been charged by the USDA with failing to provide adequate veterinary care and maintain programs of disease control and prevention for her tigers, and she was charged by state officials with overcrowded conditions.

**Royal Hanneford Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Royal Hanneford numerous times for failure to provide veterinary care and meet minimum space requirements. An elephant with Royal Hanneford rampaged during a performance, causing spectators to run for safety. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**Animals used in recent acts: Elephants and bears forced to play basketball.**

**June 24, 2002:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to provide all three of its elephants with adequate veterinary care.

**December 18, 2001:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to three elephants.

**October 9, 2001:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to have a complete program of veterinary care.

**July 9, 2001:** A USDA inspector noted that Royal Hanneford Circus had no documentation to show that the elephant handler or the three elephants had had tuberculosis testing since May 2001.

**April 19, 2001:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to all three of its elephants. Two elephants were suffering from nail infections, a potentially life-threatening illness in captive elephants.

**February 16, 2001:** Royal Hanneford exhibitor Mitchel Kalmanson was cited by the USDA for failure to provide environment enhancement to primates. The inspector wrote, "[H]ousing does not fully meet the needs for considerable and complex social interactions of chimpanzees." The trainer stated that he keeps the chimpanzees in solitary confinement for the majority of the time so that they will be more motivated to perform. The inspector noted that the chimpanzees had sparse hair coats with bare patches and that the two adult chimpanzees did not have canine teeth. Kalmanson was also cited for poor lighting in the trailer where the chimpanzees were stored in cages.

**April 13, 2000:** The USDA confirmed that a Royal Hanneford elephant named Tina had tested positive for tuberculosis and that its other two elephants, Ina and Chandra, had been exposed. The three elephants were returned to Royal Hanneford's winter quarters for several months of tuberculosis treatment.

**December 27, 1999:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to provide a veterinarian's diagnosis and prescribed treatment for an elephant with infected nails and an elephant with an arthritic hip. Royal Hanneford was also cited for failure to have five elephant handlers tested for tuberculosis.

**February 21, 1999:** An elephant with Royal Hanneford rampaged during a performance in Poughkeepsie, N.Y. According to eyewitnesses, the elephant left the ring and ran into the bleachers. In a panic, spectators tripped and fell trying to get away from the elephant.

**February 11, 1999:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to provide adequate veterinary care to elephants who were in need of foot care.

Royal Hanneford was cited for failure to provide adequate space for the elephants. The inspector noted that the chains used on the elephants were too short, which prevented them from lying down, grooming themselves, and moving their feet.

Royal Hanneford was cited for feeding elephants poor-quality hay.

**October 14, 1998:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for insufficient veterinary care. The inspector noted, "The elephant Tina's front feet are in need of foot care."

**September 14, 1998:** A zebra with Royal Hanneford escaped and was found by police wandering along a busy roadway in Charlotte, N.C.

**June 4, 1998:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for insufficient veterinary care. The inspector noted, "Chandra, the largest female elephant, is in need of foot care."

**October 7, 1997:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for using inappropriate flooring in the dog and cat enclosures. The circus was cited a second time for not providing sufficient space for the dogs. The inspector noted that "a large dog is housed in an enclosure that is 29"x25"x22" high; the dog is 23" long and 20" tall at the top of its head. The enclosure does not meet required floor space." The circus was also cited for failure to have an exercise plan, identification, and records for the dogs.

**July 11, 1997:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failing to provide sufficient space for the dogs. The inspector noted that the dogs had less than 6 inches of headroom.

**March 22, 1996:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for not having records of medical treatment for the elephants' feet.

**December 6, 1995:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for drainage problems in the elephant barn. The inspector noted, "Urine was pooled at the back corner of elephant barn. ... The elephants' pads and cuticles were overgrown." This could cause serious problems with elephants. Elephants' feet are prone to foot rot, which eventually can cripple the animal. The inspector also cited Royal Hanneford for failure to keep records of veterinary care.

**January 13, 1994:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for insufficient caging for a leopard, a member of an endangered species. The cage did not provide the simple comfort of a board on which the big cat could rest.

**June 23, 1993:** The USDA cited Royal Hanneford for failure to provide a program of veterinary care.

**January 5, 1993:** During an attempted inspection, a USDA official noted that there was a "failure to make premises, animals, and records available for inspection."



**Sterling & Reid Bros. Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited Sterling & Reid for failure to provide veterinary care, shelter from the elements, cages that meet minimum space requirements, and sound fencing that protects both spectators and the animals, as well as for giving animals feces-contaminated food and water. From January 1999 through May 1999, USDA inspectors noted 46 items noncompliant with the AWA. A USDA inspector witnessed exotic cats being struck repeatedly with jagged sticks and a tiger escaping from a tent. The circus was charged with cruelty to animals after humane inspectors found malnourished ponies in a filthy trailer. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**Animals used in recent acts: Bears, camels, elephants, horses, a hyena, lions, llamas, ponies, and tigers.**

**October 19, 2002:** According to *The Virginian-Pilot*, an elephant handler with Sterling & Reid, David Creech, was convicted on three counts of animal cruelty (see September 4-5, 2002, entry) and fined \$200 on each count. The judge acquitted Creech of a fourth count, which alleged that he struck an elephant over the head with a bull hook, because it was unclear from the eyewitness account which elephant trainer committed the act.

**September 4-5, 2002:** According to *The Virginian-Pilot*, an elephant handler with Sterling & Reid, David Creech, was charged with four counts of animal cruelty for beating an elephant until her hide was bloody while performing at the Norfolk Scope on August 23. The article stated, "An investigation by the officer and an outside veterinarian determined that the elephant suffered multiple lacerations." Another elephant handler, James Zajicek, was arrested and charged with obstructing justice.

**July 20, 2002:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to provide adequate ventilation to prevent the overheating of animals stored in trailers in 98-degree heat.

**April 10, 2002:** According to the *Chicago Daily Herald*, the West Dundee, Ill., village board voted against allowing Sterling & Reid to perform in the village. One trustee who had earlier attended the circus stated, "It was very expensive and poorly run."

**February 26, 2002:** According to the *Buffalo News*, the driver of the Sterling & Reid tractor-trailer that was transporting elephants slammed into the low overhang of the North Grand Island Bridge in western New York state, sheering off the top of the trailer and agitating the elephants inside.

**January 30, 2002:** A USDA news release stated, "[Sterling & Reid] settled its case with USDA by agreeing to a \$10,000 civil penalty [see October 31, 2001]. Of that amount, \$5,000 is suspended as long as there are no future violations of the AWA for one year."

**December 20, 2001:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to maintain tiger transport cages with weakened doors, which could lead to the animals' escaping.

**October 31, 2001:** The USDA charged Sterling & Reid with violations of the AWA, including failures to meet safety, record-keeping, and housing standards.

**July 18, 2001:** According to a report by Team 4 news in Pittsburgh, "Over the past two years, the USDA has cited the circus for nearly 50 infractions and given it \$3,000 in fines."

**July 11, 2001:** City officials in Akron, Ohio, closed down Sterling & Reid early after discovering that the traveling circus did not comply with electrical, bleacher, and tent safety standards.

**June 26, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for physically abusing elephants while touring with Sterling & Reid. The inspector observed the handler gouge an elephant named Ronnie on the trunk with a bull hook, causing an open lesion, and a different handler was "observed raking the back of another elephant several times with his hook during the performance."

**May 25, 2001:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not providing minimum space to two tigers.

**April 4, 2001:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not providing animals with a diet approved by a veterinarian. The USDA also noted that the two tigers were not provided with minimum space and that the circus had an exercise pen for the tigers but was not using it.

**February 15, 2001:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to correct previously identified violations of not providing two tigers with minimum space, not providing animals with a diet approved by a veterinarian, improper food storage, failure to maintain transport compartments, and inadequate recordkeeping.

**November 21, 2000:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to provide minimum space to two tigers. The circus was cited previously for this inadequacy on August 24, 2000, and December 14, 1999. The inspector found that the tigers were living in their travel wagons during the off-season.

The circus was cited for failure to provide animals with a diet approved by a veterinarian. Sterling & Reid was cited previously for this inadequacy on August 24, 2000, and May 16, 1999.

The circus was also cited for failure to maintain a transport trailer and the tigers' travel wagons.

**October 4, 2000:** Citing a lack of interest, Sterling & Reid Bros. Circus canceled four shows that it had scheduled for the Montgomery County, Md., fairgrounds.

**August 24, 2000:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to provide minimum

space to two tigers. The inspector noted that the white tiger had missing fur around his elbows, an indication that the tiger was rubbing against the cage.

The circus was cited for failure to provide animals with a diet approved by a veterinarian. Sterling & Reid was cited previously for this inadequacy on May 16, 1999.

The circus was cited for failure to maintain transport trailers with areas of ripped sheet metal, holes, sides bowing outwards, and splintering plywood. The roll-down door that closes the back of the trailer was in severe disrepair and was not strong enough to hold back the two tiger crates in the event that the winch broke. The interior wall was covered with urine, grime, and dirt. There was clutter stored near the tigers that could pose a danger to the animals.

Sterling & Reid was cited for improper handling. The inspector wrote, "I watched at least 40 people (adults and children) walk directly up to the tiger transport enclosures. These enclosures did not have any barriers present. The public was seen touching the tigers' paws through the wire mesh. [T]wo employees draped a canvas awning over the two enclosures. This awning is too heat retaining for these animals."

The circus was also cited for improper food and bedding storage and failure to maintain records.

**June 8, 2000:** Sterling & Reid bear exhibitor Kim Vilouk was cited by the USDA for failure to maintain the structural strength of cages and a transport trailer.

**June 6, 2000:** Ten ponies escaped from a Sterling & Reid pen at 6 a.m. while the circus was in Loves Park, Ill. The county sheriff and two police departments closed two lanes of a busy highway for 45 minutes while they recaptured the animals.

**May 27, 2000:** A shark expert with the National Aquarium in Baltimore reviewed videotape and eyewitness accounts of the Sterling & Reid shark show and commented that the exposure to light appeared inadequate for the lemon and nurse sharks, who require 10 to 13 hours of light per day. The rectangular shape of the tank was undesirable, possibly causing the pectoral fin lesions on the lemon sharks. Manual restraint during a diver's "swim with" demonstration can place strain on the nurse shark's cartilaginous skeleton and cause stress. The educational value of the show was criticized for perpetuating the myth that shark cartilage is a remedy for cancer, reinforcing the negative image of sharks, and describing nurse sharks as "lazy."

**May 6, 2000:** According to a report obtained from the Better Business Bureau, Sterling & Reid Bros. Circus has an "unsatisfactory record" and has shown a "pattern of no response to customer complaints."

**April 11, 2000:** The *Albuquerque Journal* reported that the USDA has opened two investigations into alleged AWA violations that were discovered in April and December 1999.

**April 2, 2000:** A 9-year-old, 400-pound Syrian brown bear fell from a Sterling & Reid trailer while the circus was driving on a freeway through New Orleans, La., at night. The bear had been hit by the trailer and was dazed and bleeding from his mouth when he was found on the road by motorists. Traffic was halted for three

hours while the bear was tranquilized and transported to the Audubon Zoo for treatment. The circus noticed that the bear was gone when they stopped for fuel 20 miles down the road. The bear was returned to the circus the next day.

**January 19, 2000:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for broken Plexiglas panes on two sides of the tiger cage.

**December 14, 1999:** Sterling & Reid was cited for improper food storage, inadequate space for the tiger, and record-keeping deficiencies.

**May 16, 1999:** For the fifth time in four months, the USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to have a written program for veterinary care and to provide animals with a diet approved by a veterinarian.

**May 3, 1999:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to have a program for veterinary care and to provide animals with a diet approved by a veterinarian.

The circus was cited for the second time for using a dog act by an unlicensed exhibitor.

**April 24, 1999:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to have a written program for veterinary care for the camels, provide structurally sound enclosures for the animals, and provide sufficient space for the exotic cats.

**April 15, 1999:** Sterling & Reid was cited for the second time in one month for inappropriate handling of animals. The trainer poked, prodded, and jabbed the exotic cats. The trainer did not have the expertise needed to handle exotic cats. During the inspection, one tiger escaped from the tent. The circus allowed a group of children to enter the tent where the exotic cats were kept. There was no barrier to protect the animals or the general public.

There was no written program for veterinary care for the camels.

The camels were given feces-contaminated water. The USDA inspector stated, "When I pointed this out, it was immediately turned over, spilling into the hay that was provided for the animals to eat."

The camels were not provided with shelter. The circus tied the camels in direct sunlight (85-90 degrees) without shelter from the sun.

The circus was cited again for failing to provide a diet approved by a veterinarian.

The circus failed to provide sufficient space for the tigers to exercise.

The circus failed to fix enclosures that had been identified by the USDA as having problems several weeks earlier.

**April 8-9, 1999:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for failure to have documentation of veterinary care for a camel with spasmodic muscle tremors, a tiger with ringworm, and exotic cats with facial and body lesions. The circus failed to follow veterinary instructions by not administering medication to a tiger with a history of fractures and by not providing follow-up veterinary care to another tiger.

The exotic cats were struck with a broken hockey stick with jagged wood ends. The inspector stated, "In order to shift one tiger into the arena, the animal was poked, prodded, and struck with poles. The lion was poked and prodded repeatedly while refusing to return to his platform. Eventually, he was struck across the face

several times by the trainer in the ring (Tito Nunez). The trainer appeared at a loss to control the animal and appeared to be receiving instructions from Jim Crawford outside the ring. The use of food as an incentive was not attempted until after physical abuse failed to move the animal." The USDA cited the circus for failing to have trainers with the appropriate qualifications. The inspector stated, "[The] trainer appeared to lack ability to control animals without abuse."

The enclosures for the animals were broken, bent, and lacking structural strength.

Sterling & Reid failed to provide shelter from inclement weather. The USDA inspector observed that exotic cats were forced to endure heavy rain, strong winds, and low temperatures (30 degrees). Camels were tethered in heavy rain for more than half an hour with no shelter of any kind. Trucks used to transport the animals were available as shelter but were not used. The inspector noted, "Attendants were nearby, sitting at tables under shelter."

The animals' food was stored improperly. There was a strong odor of spoiled meat and blood spattered on the walls of the food-storage area.

The camels were not provided with adequate space. The camels' tethers were so short that they could not raise their heads to normal level.

The circus forced a tiger with a chronic arthritic condition to perform. After performing, the animal displayed lameness and weakness. The USDA had determined during a previous inspection that this animal was unsuitable for performances.

The circus did not provide the exotic cats with a veterinarian-approved diet or sufficient space to exercise.

The circus was cited for using a dog act by an unlicensed exhibitor.

**February 22, 1999:** The USDA cited Sterling & Reid for inadequate transport enclosures for the animals.

**January 12, 1999:** The inspector reiterated during a telephone conversation that two exotic cats were unsuitable for performances.

**January 6, 1999:** During an announced inspection by the USDA, Sterling & Reid was cited for the following noncompliant items:

The cages for exotic cats were not large enough to provide normal postural adjustments. The inspector stated, "Felix's [lion's] head bumped the ceiling when standing straight on all four legs, and Tiberius' [lion's] grazed it, so that raising the head even slightly above normal would have caused it to bump."

One tiger had abrasions bilaterally at the tail head. The inspector noted, "They were typical in appearance of abrasions from the cage sides due to inadequate interior space."

The veterinary care program was inadequate. The feeding program was inadequate. Cages and transport vehicles were in need of repair.

The inspector noted that two exotic cats exhibited limb weakness and lameness that is aggravated by performing and should not be used.

**July 24, 1998:** The Great Falls Police Protective Association in Montana sued Sterling & Reid for failing to pay the association \$6,000 for sponsorship of the circus.

**June 18, 1998:** Two dozen people were injured in West Salem, Wis., when the tent

collapsed just after a tiger act. Circus operators had failed to evacuate the tent after police warned them of an impending storm.

**April 3, 1998:** The San Bernardino Humane Society in California confiscated eight ponies from a filthy Sterling & Reid trailer and charged the circus with cruelty to animals. The ponies were severely malnourished. The circus later pleaded guilty to the charges.

**May 21, 1992:** According to *The Record*, Richard Garden, who owned Toby Tyler Circus and United Funding, was "accused of cheating charities and deceiving donors across the country. ... United Funding was sued or banned in a dozen states for deceptive telephone pitches. ... Toby Tyler Circus was cited for safety violations that resulted in bleacher collapses in Middletown Township, Pa., and Greenport, N.Y., where the 70 injured included an infant who suffered a skull fracture." Garden started the Sterling & Reid Bros. Circus in 1998.

**July 4, 1988:** According to the *St. Petersburg Times* and *The Washington Post*, authorities confiscated numerous animals from Richard Garden's Wonder Zoo after they were found in three abandoned trucks without food and water in temperatures that soared above 100 degrees. The trucks were found in Fairfax County, Va., and North Pinellas County, Md. Among the animals seized were an elephant, a tiger, a hyena, and a rhinoceros. The elephant was severely stressed and malnourished and suffered from a leg injury. Earlier in 1988, Garden was ordered to pay \$2.3 million in fines and restitution resulting from an illegal charity solicitation scheme. Garden started the Sterling & Reid Bros. Circus in 1998.

**Walker Bros. Circus has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (AWA). The U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) has charged Walker Bros. Circus with numerous violations of the AWA, including failure to maintain programs of disease control and prevention for transporting two elephants infected with a human strain of tuberculosis and endangering both animal and human lives. Walker Bros. Circus uses elephants from Hawthorn Corporation. Walker Bros. Circus no longer has its own USDA license and instead uses an elephant handler employed by Hawthorn Corporation. Walker Bros. Circus attracts customers to participate in birthday celebrations for an elephant named Maude, citing a variety of birth dates and ages. Maude was a baby when she was captured in the wild in 1937. She is over 60 years old, and her birth date is not known. Contact PETA for documentation.**

**October 11, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct a previously identified violation of not providing veterinary care by an experienced veterinarian to elephants traveling with Walker Bros. Circus. The inspector wrote, "I spoke with the veterinarian ... that had examined the animals on 10/10/01. He stated that he was not sure about the proper treatment for the elephants because he did not have much experience [in] treating them."

**October 5, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to correct previously identified violations of not providing veterinary care and security for its elephants traveling with Walker Bros. Circus.

Delhi had an open, draining, and bleeding wound on her nail with blood stains on and around the nail and foot. The area above the nail was swollen and warm to the touch. The cuticles on both of her front feet were "very overgrown." Delhi was limping in pain and favored her leg during the performance. There were no documents to indicate that a qualified person was providing foot care. Tess' left eye was very teary, and she was squinting; the trainer claimed that he had run out of an antibiotic ointment to treat her eye. Two bottles of expired medication were found by the inspector.

The inspector also observed that an experienced elephant handler was not present while the public came near elephants walking freely in a pen. The inspector returned later, after the report had been discussed with the licensee, and again found that the elephants were loose and unattended.

**October 2, 2001:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care to three elephants (Liz, Delhi, and Tess, traveling with Walker Bros. Circus) with overgrown nails and cuticles. Hawthorn was also cited for failure to have dangerous animals under the control of experienced handlers. The inspector observed parents and children approaching and petting elephants while no attendant was present.

Hawthorn was cited for failure to provide structurally sound enclosures. The inspector wrote, "[T]he elephants were inside an orange plastic mesh 'fence.' It was down in two places. ... [Local authorities] informed me that earlier in the day, at least one [elephant] was outside this enclosure. Two [elephants] were completely free from any restraint. ... A water hose was running water over an electrical cord. This area was able to be touched by both elephants and the public."

**October 1, 2001:** The Harlan County Society for Prevention of Cruelty to Animals in Kentucky lodged a complaint with a county judge after observing that Hawthorn elephants with Walker Bros. Circus had "numerous red and raw spots on their ears from being speared with the hook-like device the trainer uses. ... The traveling quarters for the animals were at best cramped and inadequate. And at no time did I see any water dish or clean food be provided for any of the ... elephants."

**September 18, 2001:** PETA filed a complaint with the Federal Trade Commission asking the agency to investigate alleged fraudulent advertising practices. Walker Bros. Circus uses the media to promulgate deceptive information in an effort to lure customers to the circus by advertising a birthday celebration for an elephant named Maude. These promotions typically invite the public to bring food for Maude or to come early to buy rides on elephants or ponies.

Maude's "birthday parties" occur on various dates across the country, and the circus provides inconsistent information about her age, sometimes listing it as between 40 and 45 and at other times giving a specific age in that range. The circus indicates that it knows the date of Maude's birth, suggesting that she was born in captivity, and misrepresents her age. According to the Asian Elephant Studbook, Maude was a baby when she was captured in the wild and taken from her family in 1937. Elephant captures are violent and often result in the mature members of the herd being killed. Maude's birth date is not known. She is over 60 years old, yet is still being subjected to grueling circus routines and a stressful life on the road.

**May 15, 2001:** According to the *Chicago Sun-Times*, horses, ponies, and a Walker Bros. circus worker were injured in a traffic accident involving two circus tractor-trailers in Merrillville, Ind. The accident report states that one circus vehicle traveling at a high rate of speed swerved out of control, crossed a median and oncoming traffic, then tipped over onto its side. A police officer wrote, "No insurance information was available on the vehicles at the time of crash."

**April 13, 2001:** A letter to the editor published in the *Chicago Sun-Times* stated, "I escorted a group of schoolchildren, including my 8-year-old daughter, to this year's Medinah Shrine Circus. ... When the elephants were brought behind the curtain, the trainer began verbally abusing and hitting the elephant. We watched in horror as he swung a stick with all his force and struck the elephant in the back of the leg. This must have hurt because the elephant let out a scream that could be heard throughout the UIC Pavilion. The kids were frightened and asked me why the man was hurting the elephant."

According to documents from the city of Chicago, a cruelty to animals complaint was filed against trainer John Caudill. Caudill, of Walker Bros. Circus, uses the stage name Johnny Walker III.

**July 9, 1999:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care to an elephant named Lota, who had a "large open wound on the right hip area." The inspector wrote, "During the inspection, the left side of the wound was weeping and bloody." Lota travels with Walker Bros. Circus.

**January 23, 1998:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for insufficient pens for sheep and problems with veterinary care and feeding. The inspector noted, "[S]heep had thick coats of wool through which their body condition was not immediately evident."



However, on palpation of two of them, it became evident that they were somewhat thin."

**February 6, 1997:** The USDA cited Hawthorn for failure to provide veterinary care. The inspector wrote, "Lota is extremely thin, and [her] eyes appear to be sunken in." Lota travels with Walker Bros. Circus.

**February 1997:** The USDA charged Walker Bros. Circus with AWA violations for operating without a license; failure to maintain complete records showing the acquisition, disposition, and identification of animals; failure to maintain programs of disease control and prevention, euthanasia, and adequate veterinary care under the supervision and assistance of a doctor of veterinary medicine; failure to provide a sufficient distance or barrier between animals and the general viewing public so as to ensure the safety of the animals and the public; failure to place animals under the direct control and supervision of a knowledgeable and experienced animal handler; and failure to transport animals in structurally sound enclosures and maintain these enclosures in good repair so as to protect the animals from injury. Dr. Ron DeHaven of the USDA stated, "These charges are very serious. The Animal Welfare Act, designed to provide for and protect animals, was allegedly ignored. Not only were animal lives in danger, but human lives as well."

**January 1, 1997:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for not keeping appropriate records for the animals and for an incomplete program of veterinary care.

**October 1996:** Health officials obtained a court injunction to stop Walker Bros. from entering Florida because the circus was traveling with two elephants infected with a strain of tuberculosis transmittable to humans.

**August 27, 1996:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for failing to have a veterinary program for elephants.

**October 10, 1995:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for several noncompliant items, including unsafe enclosures, insufficient fencing, and failure to have a program of veterinary care. The circus was also cited for inappropriate handling of the elephants. The USDA inspector stated, "Each elephant had [two or three] puncture wounds behind the left ear and at least one under the chin from **uncareful use of [an] elephant hook**. One puncture on Liz had some pus in one of these small wounds."

**August 14, 1995:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for failing to have holding facilities that were structurally sound and maintained in order to protect the animals from injury. The circus was also cited for failing to have a program of veterinary care.

**July 10, 1995:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for storing the animals' food with toxic substances. The circus was also cited for failing to have a program of veterinary care for the animals. Lota, an elephant "rented" from the Hawthorn Corporation, another facility with multiple, serious violations of the AWA, had deep fissures on her feet that the USDA inspector identified as needing medical attention.

**January 10, 1995:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for failing to have a valid license. The circus also did not have records or a written program of veterinary care for the animals.

**August 3, 1994:** The USDA cited Walker Bros. for failing to have a barrier fence for the elephants. The inspector noted, "[T]he barrier fence around the elephants is not complete, and there is no attendant on duty, allowing a couple with a small child to approach the animals." The circus also had no written program or records of veterinary care.

**June 21, 1988:** According to USDA and Canadian law enforcement documents, while a Hawthorn elephant named Tyke was performing with Tarzan Zerbini Circus, "The elephant handler was observed beating the single-tusk African elephant in public to the point [where] the elephant was screaming and bending down on three legs to avoid being hit. Even when the handler walked by the elephant after this, the elephant screamed and veered away, demonstrating fear from his presence." The handler was John Caudill (a.k.a. John Walker, current owner of Walker Bros. Circus), who admitted to "disciplining" Tyke after she hit Caudill's brother and put a hole in his back with her tusk.

**William Morris has failed to meet minimal federal standards for the care of animals used in exhibition as established in the Animal Welfare Act (A W A). The United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) has cited William Morris for repeated failure to provide adequate veterinary care and for failure to provide a nutritional diet to two undersized elephants, shelter from the elements, and adequate ventilation. William Morris leases his elephant act to circuses and fairs. Contact PETA for documentation.**

Animals used in recent shows: two African elephants named Linda and Shannon and one Asian elephant named Cora.

**June 17, 2002:** While performing with the Shrine Circus in Menomonie, Wis., Morris' elephant Mary and another elephant bolted out of a circus tent during a show, scattering crowds. Mary hiked two miles through town and was recaptured at the University of Wisconsin-Stout campus when trucks blocked her escape. One child was injured, and the elephants damaged a door at the park and caused \$600 in damage to a city truck. The Shriners had contracted with George Carden Circus for the event.

**December 13, 2001:** A USDA inspector noted that Morris' elephant Linda was euthanized and that Morris' elephant Mary was residing with the George Carden Circus and being handled by the owner's son, Billy Morris Jr.

**May 15, 2001:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to have a primary facility for an African elephant named Mary. Morris contracted with the city of Branson, Mo., to exhibit Mary for 30 weeks. According to news reports, Mary was being kept in solitary confinement and used in a magic act at Branson's Majestic Theatre.

**March 8, 2001:** Morris was cited by the USDA for failure to supply the required itinerary. A USDA inspector was unable to conduct an animal welfare inspection because Morris had taken the elephants on the road.

**November 14, 2000:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. An elephant named Linda was found to have angular limb deformities in at least three limbs, degenerative joint disease, and periodic lameness.

The inspector wrote, "[T]here is still no regular recording on the daily salve and topical applications on Shannon's temporal gland infection. There is no record of the original recommendations on how to treat this; and there was no record that a veterinarian with appropriate knowledge of elephants had examined this problem. There was also no record of the attending veterinarian approving the substitution of alternative nutritional supplements, as cited on the last inspection. The attending veterinarian reportedly prescribed that Adequan was to be given; currently, Linda is not receiving this. The concrete floor of the bam may present special problems for Linda; this should also be discussed with the vet."

**September 12, 2000:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. An elephant named Shannon with a 3 1/2-inch open sore on her left cheek needed to be examined and evaluated by a veterinarian. An elephant named Linda was not receiving vitamins prescribed by the attending veterinarian for a

deformed right knee. There were no medical records detailing treatments and dates for either elephant.

Morris was cited for failure to have acquisition records for the three elephants.

**December 1, 1999:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to comply with minimum standards of veterinary care. An elephant handler did not have a current tuberculosis test, and there were no records of dewormings.

Morris was also cited for failure to store food in a manner that prevents contamination.

The inspector noted that two elephants appeared to have overgrown soles and instructed Morris to continue monitoring the elephants' weight.

**November 24, 1998:** The USDA inspector noted that an African elephant named Shannon continued to suffer from a chronic problem of poor weight gain. There was no current record of veterinary consultations or recommendations to treat chronic hyperkeratosis in the two African elephants.

**April 21, 1998:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to maintain the structural strength of the elephant enclosure. Morris was also instructed to eliminate potentially hazardous escape routes and to end the practice of leaving trailer doors open and tied with only a strap during transport.

**April 9, 1998:** Morris was cited by the USDA for improper food storage, inadequate pest control, and failure to maintain the structural strength of the travel trailer.

**December 16, 1997:** In a letter to the USDA, Morris wrote, "[T]he trailer I transport our elephants in does not have enough ventilation. "

**December 15, 1997:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to provide adequate veterinary care. The elephants were in need of foot and skin care and the two African elephants were "not of appropriate body size for their age." The inspector wrote, "[T]here was no consistent nutritional plan designed by the vet to provide a balanced diet."

Morris was also cited for failure to maintain the structural strength of the travel trailer and outdoor corral and for failure to provide adequate shelter.

The inspector noted, "The elephants do not have sufficient space to make normal postural and social adjustments with adequate freedom of movement within the trailer."

Morris was also notified of the need to improve ventilation in the travel trailer.

**December 18, 1996:** The USDA cited Morris for failure to provide the elephants with adequate foot and skin care.